To: Mary L. Larsgaard, chair  
ALA/ALCTS/CCS Committee on Cataloging: Description and Access

From: Heidi G. Lerner, chair, Cataloging Committee,  
Research & Special Libraries Division, Association of Jewish Libraries


Below is a summary of recommendations from the Research & Special Libraries (R&S) Cataloging Committee of the Association of Jewish Libraries. These recommendations also reflect contributions from the Hebraica Team at the Library of Congress (LC) that were formulated in response to discussions held at LC regarding the simplification of AACR2 Ch. 21 special rules (rules 21.37–21.39) and related rules in Ch. 25. Each rule is provided (as currently worded) for reference and is followed by the recommendation.

**SACRED SCRIPTURES**

21.37A. Enter a work that is accepted as sacred scripture by a religious group, or part of such a work, under title. When appropriate, use a uniform title as instructed in 25.17-25.18. Make an added entry under the heading for one, two, or three persons associated with the work and/or the item being catalogued. If there are four or more such persons, do not make added entries.

**Recommendation:** Retain the concept of entering under title a work that is accepted as sacred, but modify the phrase “sacred scripture.” Despite some ambiguity with respect to the term “sacred,” it is acceptable to describe the texts covered by these rules as sacred; however, the term “scripture” does not apply in all cases. Therefore, the use of the phrase “sacred works or scriptures” is recommended. This phrase is also consistent with that used in the Subject Cataloging Manual (H1188). Note also that the term “sacred scripture” would need to be modified in 25.17 and 25.18.

25.17A. Use as the uniform title for a sacred scripture (see 21.37) the title by which it is most commonly identified in English-language reference sources dealing with the religious group(s) to which the scripture belongs. If no such source is available, use general reference sources.

**Recommendation:** Retain the list of specific sacred texts to be entered under title that are given in current rule 25.17A but expand the list to include other texts (e.g., the works of the Bahai Faith ...) Retain the phrase “the title by which it is most commonly identified in English-language reference sources dealing with the religious group(s) to which the scripture belongs,” in order to justify reconsideration of the uniform title “Bible. O.T.”

25.18A. Enter a Testament as a subheading of Bible. Enter a book of the Catholic or Protestant canon as a subheading of the appropriate Testament.
Recommendation: We endorse the current practice of entering individual books under the “appropriate Testament.” Note that the approach taken with regard to the headings for individual books is dependent upon the approach taken with regard to the heading “Bible. O.T.” The notion of “Bible. Genesis,” whereby Bible signifies the Christian Bible, is as problematic from a Jewish cultural/theological perspective as is the term “Bible. O.T.”


Recommendation: Reexamine the mandatory “Enter the Old Testament as Bible. O.T.” since the Hebrew scriptures are not universally known as the “Old Testament.” The goal of incorporating a global perspective within the new code argues for taking a more culturally sensitive approach. Members of the Judaica library and scholarly community have expressed dissatisfaction with “Bible. O.T.” for many years. As noted above, the current 25.17A, which refers to “reference sources dealing with the religious group(s) to which the scripture belongs”, also, supports reconsidering the title “Bible. O.T.” The dilemma, of course is determining an appropriate replacement, which would be acceptable to all parties and would not impact collocation (daunting file maintenance issues, aside). The ideal from a Jewish cultural/theological perspective would be to enter the heading directly, as in “Hebrew Bible,” “Hebrew Scriptures,” or the Hebrew term “Tanakh,” (which is increasingly being used in English language sources, including LC’s revised BM and KBM classification schedules). We realize, however, that entering “Tanakh” directly might not be acceptable for all, so a compromise approach might be “Bible. Hebrew Bible,” “Bible. Hebrew scriptures,” or “Bible. Tanakh.” There may be other possible formulations, and we’d be interested in hearing such suggestions.

Rules 25.18A3–25.18A12

Recommendation: May require revision to reflect decision on “Bible. O.T.”

25.18A13. Year. Add the year of publication of the item to the uniform title.

Recommendation: Retain practice of adding the year, which aids in sorting of lengthy files.

25.18A14. Apocryphal books. Use the title commonly found in English-language sources as the uniform title of an apocryphal book (i.e., one included neither in the Catholic canon nor in the Protestant Apocrypha). Make explanatory references from Bible.

Recommendation: We endorse retention of this rule, although the phrase “(i.e., one included neither in the Catholic canon nor in the Protestant Apocrypha)” should be deleted. The existing explanatory references are helpful in identifying to which tradition the given apocryphal book belongs.
25.18B1. Talmud. Enter a particular order (seder) or a tractate or treatise (masekhet) of the Talmud as a subheading of Talmud or Talmud Yerushalmi, as appropriate. Use the form of name of these parts found in the Encyclopedia Judaica.

Recommendation: Rule should be retained, and we confirm that the EJ is still the most authoritative reference source for Judaica. Most, if not all, of the headings in this category have already been established anyway, and there is no advantage to changing or rethinking them. There is some question, however, as to whether specific authoritative sources should continue to be cited within the body of the rules themselves. If it is not the general practice to cite specific reference sources, perhaps a list of sources could appear separately in some type of appendix, so that modifications, additions, etc., can be more easily made in the future.

25.18C1. Mishnah & Tosefta and 25.18E1. Midrashim

Recommendation: See comments regarding use of EJ at 25.18B1.

THEOLOGICAL CREEDS, CONFESSIONS OF FAITH, ETC.

21.38A. [and related 25.19B]. Enter a theological creed, confession of faith, etc., accepted by more than one denominational body under title. When appropriate, use a uniform title as instructed in 25.19B. Make an added entry under the heading for one, two, or three persons or corporate bodies associated with the work and/or item being catalogued. If there are four or more such persons or bodies, do not make added entries.

Recommendation: There needs to be acknowledgment that an individual creed may be entered under personal author, which is appropriate in the Jewish context where creeds have been attributed to various thinkers, but are not necessarily officially accepted by any particular religious body.

LITURGICAL WORKS

21.39A1. Enter a liturgical work under the heading for the church or denominational body to which it pertains. When appropriate, add a uniform title as instructed in 25.19–25.23 to the main entry heading. If the work is special to the use of a particular body within the church (e.g., a diocese, cathedral, monastery, religious order), make an added entry under the heading for that body.

Recommendation: We endorse rewording from “under the heading for the church or denominational body to which it pertains” to “under the heading for the body to which it pertains.” See comments at 21.39C1 below.
21.39A2. Enter an item consisting of readings from sacred scriptures intended for use in a religious service as instructed in 21.39A1. However, enter a single passage from a sacred scripture used in religious services as instructed in 21.37.

**Recommendation:** Change “sacred scriptures” to “sacred works and scriptures.”

21.39C1. **Jewish liturgical works.** Enter a Jewish liturgical work under its title. When appropriate, use a uniform title as instructed in 25.21–25.22. If the work is special to the use of a particular body (association, congregation, synagogue, etc.), make an added entry under the heading for that body.

**Recommendation:** We considered the possibility of eliminating this exceptional practice for Jewish liturgical works in the name of simplification. Nevertheless, we could not see any benefits to changing our current practice of entering under the title, particularly the uniform title as described 25.21–25.22, qualifying the heading as needed, and providing an added entry for the related body. This practice serves to both collocate and differentiate in a useful manner.

25.19A. If the name of a body under which a liturgical work is entered is given in English, use as uniform title a well-established English title if there is one.

**Recommendation:** General rule would benefit from examples from various religious traditions.

25.21A. **Jewish liturgical works.** Use as the uniform title for a Jewish liturgical work its name as found in the *Encyclopedia Judaica*.

**Recommendation:** We endorse retention of this rule. (See comments at 21.39A1, above; also comments about EJ at 25.18B1, above.)

25.22A. **Variant and Special Texts.** If the item being catalogued contains an authorized or traditional variant or special text of a liturgical work, add in parentheses (in this order of preference): 1) the name of a special rite (e.g., a Latin rite other than the Roman rite for Catholic works; a rite other than the unmodified Ashkenazic rite for Jewish works)

**Recommendation:** Although provisions for breaking conflicts in uniform titles may be covered in the general provisions for uniform titles, there is some value in retaining this rule, at least in some modified form. We frequently need to qualify liturgical works by rite (and/or other elements), so retaining the example “Haggadah (Sephardic)” may be useful since we recommend retaining 21.39C1. However, modification of the rule should be considered to end the current practice of not qualifying Ashkenazic rite works, which, in effect, identifies Ashkenazic rite as the norm and may be considered to reflect a cultural bias.