Association for Library Collections and Technical Services
(A division of the American Library Association)
Cataloging and Classification Section

Committee on Cataloging: Description and Access

Task Force on Rule 0.24

Report to CC:DA
1999 Annual

May 26, 1999
CONTENTS

I. Executive Summary 3

II. Introduction 6

III. History 6

IV. Problems with Rule 0.24 8
   1. The multiple characteristics problem 8
   2. The format variation problem 10
   3. Other functions and problems? 11
   4. Cataloguing of examples of items with multiple characteristics using current AACR2R 12

V. Objectives for the Rule 0.24 Revision Process 18

VI. Options to Deal with Multiple Characteristics 19
   Option 1 to deal with multiple characteristics 19
   Option 2 to deal with multiple characteristics 20
   Option 3 to deal with multiple characteristics 25
   Option 4 to deal with multiple characteristics 26

VII. Options to Deal with Format Variations 27
   Option 1 to deal with format variations 27
   Option 2 to deal with format variations 29
   Option 3 to deal with format variations 32
   Option 4 to deal with format variations 34
   Option 5 to deal with format variations 38

VIII. Change to Section Heading ‘Methods of Procedure’ 42

IX. GMD’s—a Special Problem 42

X. Introductory Chapter 44

Appendix A: Report from the Subgroup on Option 1 for Multiple Characteristics 45
Appendix B: Reorganization of Area 1 by Martha Yee 53
Appendix C: Some Definitions from Various Sources 70
Appendix D: A Quick Study of Where the Rules in Any Given ISBD Area Differ Based on Class of Material in Current AACR2R 76
Appendix E: AACR2R Chapters Compared to ISBD 79
Appendix F: AACR2R Chapters Compared to GMD’s and SMD’s 80
Appendix G: AACR2R (United States) Compared to MARC 21 84
Appendix H: Options Considered but not Worked on 88
Appendix I: Discussion of the Definitions of Edition/Expression, Manifestation, Item, and Related Work 91
I. Executive Summary

In this report, we identify two major types of problems with rule 0.24 as currently written. First, there are problems in applying the current rule to items that have multiple characteristics, such as a serial digital map, or a digitized music manuscript. Secondly, there are problems in applying the current rule to a particular edition (or expression) of a work that exists in multiple physical formats (manifestations) or that exists in manifestations that have minor variations in distribution information but are otherwise identical in intellectual or artistic content. This second problem is sometimes referred to as the multiple versions problem.

We suggest 4 options for revising rule 0.24 to improve the handling of items with multiple characteristics in AACR2. In addition, we suggest 5 options for revising rule 0.24 to improve the handling of minor variation in physical format or in distribution information, i.e. variation at the manifestation level. For each option, we suggest language for a revised text of rule 0.24.

Note that since rule 0.24 is designed to instruct cataloguers in the use of the current chapters of AACR2R, some potential changes in rule 0.24 can involve change in the current organization of chapters of AACR2R. For some options, therefore, our recommendations involve addition of a chapter or chapters, or reorganization of the current chapters based on other criteria besides the current one of ‘class of materials.’

Items with multiple characteristics

Option 1 recommends changing the text of rule 0.24 in part to read “It is a central principle of the use of part I that description should be based first on one of three forms of issuance: monograph, serial, or integrating entity, and subsequently on the other chapters in part I (chapters 2-11) which collectively represent classes of materials which share certain common characteristics. After form of issuance has been determined, choose the chapter (class of materials) most applicable in describing the item and in determining the chief source of information as necessary to make it clear to the user of the bibliographic record what the item looks like physically and what its contains. For items made up of several types of material, see 1.10. For items with multiple characteristics, cataloging agencies or user groups may determine what characteristics should receive preferential consideration in the descriptive sequence.”
It is further recommended:

1. that we leave the current chapters 1-11 of AACR2R in the order they now are and with their texts essentially intact.

2. that we expand existing chapters (or write additional chapters) as necessary to provide for electronic resources, digitized and microform reproductions and originals. For electronic resources indicate that when a bibliographic item is remotely accessed on a computer, the description can be based on the observed or otherwise known characteristics of the item.

3. that we add, however it is deemed best, a discussion of integrating resources.

Option 2 recommends changing the text of rule 0.24 to emphasize that it is important to bring out all aspects of the item being described, including its content, its carrier, its form of issuance, its relationship to other manifestations of the same edition/expression of the same work, and whether it is published or unpublished. In addition, it is recommended that the descriptive chapters of AACR2R (chapters 1-13) be reorganized based on ISBD area.

Option 3 recommends changing the text of rule 0.24 to indicate that for items with multiple characteristics, the chapter that occurs first in AACR2R should take precedence over any chapter that occurs later. In addition, it is recommended that the descriptive chapters of AACR2R (chapters 1-13) be reordered to put content chapters before carrier chapters, and the form of issuance chapter (12) at the end.

Option 4 recommends that option 1 be adopted in the short term, and option 2 be adopted in the long term.

Format variation

Option 1 recommends that the text of rule 0.24 be modified to remove the term ‘physical’ and indicate that it is permissible to base the description on an original rather than a reproduction when that is possible without research into the nature of the original.

Option 2 recommends that current practice on when to make a new record, as found in OCLC guidelines, CONSER guidelines, and LCRI 1.0, be codified and added to AACR2.

Option 3 recommends that the MULVER guidelines be adopted by AACR2. This would call for a single record approach for reproductions, but not for any other type of manifestation change.
Option 4 recommends that the ISBD(ER) approach of ignoring minor physical variations below the SMD level be adopted by AACR2.

Option 5 recommends that any manifestation variation, whether it be change in physical format or change in distribution information, be ignored, as long as it is not connected with change in the edition/expression of the work.

In addition, the Task Force recommends that, whatever approach is adopted, rules concerning GMD’s be made compatible with the approach taken, and that an introductory chapter concerning the principles underlying AACR2 be added to the code.
II. Introduction

This document constitutes the report of the CCDA Task Force on Rule 0.24 for the CCDA meeting at ALA Annual 1999. We would appreciate as much guidance as you can give us as to which of the options that we present meet with your support. We would also appreciate guidance concerning what improvements the report needs in order to fulfill our charge from the Joint Steering Committee of advancing the discussion of intellectual content over physical format.

III. History

At the Toronto Conference, participants agreed that content vs. carrier problems in AACR2R were among the top three problems with the code as currently constituted.

Toronto Conference/JSC work on revision of AACR2:

Subsequent to the Toronto Conference, the JSC met to decide what to do based on the recommendations made at the conference, and among the set of action items they produced were:

1. “Solicit a proposal to revise rule 0.24 to advance the discussion on the primacy of intellectual content over physical format.” JSC subsequently requested that this be carried out by CCDA. CCDA constituted the Task Force on Rule 0.24 in May of 1998, with the following charge:

   The Task Force on Rule 0.24 is charged with drafting a proposal for revision(s) to Rule 0.24 and/or other rules in AACR2R if and as appropriate to advance the discussion of intellectual content over physical format.

   The Task Force shall present CC:DA with an interim report at the 1999 ALA Annual Conference. The final report of the Task Force shall be presented to CC:DA at the 2000 Midwinter Meeting. A copy of all materials distributed to the members of the Task Force shall be sent to the Chair of CC:DA.

2. “Formalize the recommendations on seriality endorsed during the Conference and introduce them into the rule revision process.” JSC subsequently requested
that this be carried out by PCC/CONSER, which delegated the work on this action item to Jean Hirons. Jean’s report recommends, among other things, that AACR2 be reorganized based on ISBD area, with an introductory chapter addressing the cataloguing of serial and integrating works in all formats.

CONSER work on electronic serials:

http://lcweb.loc.gov/acq/conser/aacr.html
http://lcweb.loc.gov/acq/conser/issues.html

Jean Hirons’ final report:
http://www.nlc-bnc.ca/jsc/ser-rep0.html

3. “Pursue the recommendation that a data modeling technique be used to provide a logical analysis of the principles and structures that underlie AACR.” JSC subsequently requested Tom Delsey to carry out this data modelling, and his report recommends, among other things, that the content vs. carrier problem be solved by reorganizing AACR2 based on ISBD area rather than physical form of the item in hand or class of material.

Delsey report:
http://www.nlc-bnc.ca/jsc/aacr.pdf

In addition to these developments, it is important to be aware of the development of the International Standard Bibliographic Description for Electronic Resources (ISBD(ER)), which was published in 1997, and which is currently being studied by the CCDA Task Force on the Harmonization of ISBD(ER) and AACR2. The Task Force’s recommendations concerning how AACR2R should deal with electronic resources are likely to be highly relevant to the work of the Task Force on Rule 0.24.

CCDA Task Force on the Harmonization of ISBD(ER) and AACR2:
http://www.library.yale.edu/cataloging/aacrer/index.html
IV. Problems with Rule 0.24

Rule 0.24 has at least two major functions. First, it attempts to help a cataloguer figure out how to catalogue an item with multiple characteristics, i.e. an item that falls into more than one chapter in AACR2R, such as a serial digital map. Secondly, it is the only place in the code the addresses the question of when to make a new cataloguing record for an item that is very similar to another item that has already been catalogued. Currently, it implies that if there is any variation in the physical carrier between two items, even two items that contain the same edition/expression of the same work, a new record must be made for each. In this document, we refer to this as the format variation problem. It has also been known for many years as the multiple versions problem.

1. The multiple characteristics problem

Every document has the following aspects (at least potentially):

   a. form of issuance
      ▪ seriality
      ▪ one-time publication
      ▪ integrating/dynamic updating

   b. published vs. unpublished

   c. fundamental content
      ▪ textual/alpha-numeric content
      ▪ textual/alpha-numeric sound
      ▪ musical notation
      ▪ musical sound
      ▪ other sound
      ▪ moving image content
      ▪ graphic content
      ▪ spatial/cartographic/geographic content
      ▪ 3-dimensional content/artefact/object
      ▪ computer program
      ▪ mixed
d. ‘type of carrier’ or physical format, i.e. the physical medium onto which the fundamental content has been put in order to distribute it.

Examples:
- microfilm
- digital formats including CD-ROM and remote access
- book? (can contain textual, graphic, cartographic, etc. content)
- sound disc vs. audiocassette vs. CD
- 16 mm. Film vs. videocassette vs. DVD

e. method of management
- library
- archival/collection level records based on provenance

f. reproduction
- same physical format simultaneously released
- same physical format successively released such that there is an “original”
- different physical format simultaneously released
- different physical format successively released such that there is an “original”

Currently, with the current structure of the ISBDs and of Chapters 1-13 of AACR2R, the cataloguer is required to give primacy to the carrier aspect, as indicated in Rule 0.24 in AACR2R. Many feel that all aspects should be brought out in the description and given equal primacy.

---

1 We note that the term ‘carrier’ may still be lumping too much that should be split. Consider the following:

The music CD, the DVD and the CD-ROM are on the same physical material (metal coated with plastic). They have different content (e.g. music, moving image, and perhaps a database (textual and integrating) on the CD-ROM). However, there may be a third factor here—the encoding (perhaps what Delsey was trying to get at with the term ‘infixion’). Presumably each is encoded differently, based on the following observations: 1) Even though you can put each in the same tray on your computer, the computer can recognize and play the music CD right away without intervention, it can sometimes recognize the CD-ROM right away and sometimes not, and the DVD can be played only by invoking the DVD player. 2) An enhanced music CD can apparently contain text, still images or music, but not moving images.

We have seen the problems we are already having because we lumped together content, carrier and form of issuance. Perhaps we should be careful not to create similar problems in the future by lumping together physical form and infixion . . .
Also implicit in the rule in its current form is an assumption that any physical carrier is restricted to one and only one of the class of materials chapters; this unwarranted assumption causes major problems when several types of content can be issued on the same type of carrier, e.g. on a CD-ROM or in a digitized format. The current division into chapters can prevent application of a relevant rule to a particular item because it happens to fall outside the scope of the chapter containing the rule; an example occurs with moving image materials, which more and more often are issued with stereo. Sound tracks; rule 6.5C7, Number of sound channels, allows inclusion of ‘stereo.’ In the physical description for a sound recording, but an equivalent rule does not appear in chapter 7 for motion pictures and videorecordings. Format integration in MARC 21 has shown us the value of extending the use of a field or code to any item to which it is relevant, without regard to inflexible divisions into particular formats. Some feel AACR2R needs to find a way to obtain similar flexibility in order to accommodate new media. With some newer media, the scope notes at the heads of the chapters can seem to exclude an item from treatment by AACR2R at all.

2. The format variation problem

Carrier is a particularly slippery aspect, since the same edition/expression of the same work can exist on different carriers (the “multiple versions” problem); examples include the microform of a particular textual edition/expression or the digitization of a particular textual edition/expression. In current official practice, we make a new record for a new edition/expression, and we do the same thing (make a new record) for the same edition/expression in a different format. In other words, even when we know that two items represent the same edition/expression of the same work, we do not communicate that to the user; instead, by making a new record, we imply that they are different edition/expressions.

Form of issuance can change without producing a new work, as in the case of electronic serials: in text form a serial may be clearly a serial, but in electronic form, it may transform into a continuously updating database.

Content is different from carrier in this regard, however. Some types of change in content may in fact necessarily produce a new work; this cannot happen with mere changes in carrier. Can a musical work change to a photographic work (a motion picture) without significant adaptation such that a new related work is produced? Can a textual work (a novel) change to a photographic work (a motion picture) without significant adaptation such that a new related work is produced? See the prior work of the CCDA Task Force on Works Intended for Performance for a full discussion of these issues:

http://www.ala.org/alcts/organization/ccs/ccda/tf-wks1.html
3. Other functions and problems?

Some members of the Task Force felt that rule 0.24 was one of the places in AACR2R in which support for the principle of transcription is found. The reliance on transcription in AACR2R has always been questioned by archivists and serialists, and is now questioned by some experts on electronic resources, especially the integrating or database-like ones. However, it is possible that the topic of transcription alone would be enough to keep another Task Force busy for a year or two. It was the consensus of the Task Force that transcription is more directly addressed in other rules, such as 1.0A and 1.0E, which are out of scope for our work. It was also noted that a CONSER task group is working on the issue of transcription and that the Joint Steering Committee is working on a statement of the principles that underlie AACR2, of which transcription is surely one, so perhaps we should not try to recommend in this area. We certainly agree that if an introductory chapter to AACR2 is written, transcription should be addressed there. [Appendix A](#), the report from the Subgroup on Option 1 for Multiple Characteristics, contains language concerning transcription suggested by that group that might eventually form the basis for addressing the principle of transcription in such an introductory chapter.

A number of members of the Task Force feel that AACR2R does not yet adequately address the problem of mixed materials. The definition of ‘kit’ in the glossary provides some guidance about how to decide whether a text with a sound recording and a map is a kit, or whether it is a text with accompanying sound recording and map instead. However, the same type of problem can occur with interactive multimedia and other types of media that incorporate a number of different kinds of content, e.g. an item that could be either a lecture illustrated with musical performances on video, or a compilation of musical performances with some vocal commentary. Although aiding the cataloger of such mixed materials to make a decision about predominance is not one of the current functions of rule 0.24, it is possible that it would be a logical place in the rules to address this problem in a more principled manner than heretofore.

Other potential functions of rule 0.24 suggested by one member of the Task Force included:

1. *Setting the frame for the cataloguer.* Establishing the framework conditions/mindset/frame of reference under which the cataloguer must labor in accomplishing the building of a record according to Part I.

2. *No road map.* No micromanaging road map. Not to map the road but to lay out the key features of the landscape that must be visited by the cataloguer. The starting point should be up to the cataloguer, as long as content and carrier are both adequately covered in the description. Let’s not continue the
impression that we’re actually trying to map the road upon which the cataloguer must travel to create the description.

3. **Shared cataloguing databases.** Mention the importance of the existence of shared databases and the critical function that standardized description plays in creating and sharing records in those databases.

4. **Libraries and their collections.** Enable libraries to have the latitude to describe and display primarily characteristics needed for bibliographic records that describe their collections. This kind of general statement is present in the opening of the interactive multimedia guidelines & could be lifted all or in part. True, it has the potential to leads to format wars in the context of shared databases, (in many areas of the record, even at lower levels like Area 7, notes, at minimum) because it does not provide hard and fast boundaries, but it does provide fuzzy boundaries that make some of the libraries happy some of time. I’m not sure we have to specify an order of application, as long as what’s really important is brought out in the description.

5. **Knowledge basis for description.** Talking about “knowing”, thus describing bibliographic items two ways: in terms of “physical presence” for local/directly accessible items and secondly, in terms of observed or known characteristics for remotely accessible items (e.g, Internet resources or other resources mounted on a computer).

6. **Appropriate instructional tone.** In the course of tackling the above functions, write/revise the instructional voice such that the cataloguer is not talked down to or dictated to in a high-handed fashion, nor advised in archaic language that must be translated in order to be more commonly understandable.

4. **Cataloguing of examples of items with multiple characteristics using current AACR2R**

The following examples are meant to represent cataloguing done according to AACR2R as it currently stands (minus interpretation), although CONSER guidelines and Nancy Olson’s manual were consulted in the cataloguing of remote access materials, and a totally fictitious display was cobbled together for the 856 field, since it is already in widespread use, and, where applicable, provides a site that can be consulted by those who want to compare the cataloguing examples here with the item catalogued). The purpose of the exercise is to try to identify areas in which application of current rule 0.24 is not clear, ambiguity exists, and

---

2 LC rule interpretations were not consulted, for example.
cataloguer decision-making is required. Problems identified are listed in bold below each piece of cataloguing.

For all digital materials, it was frustrating to have to deal with the unfinished nature of the rules in this area. Clearly, the ISBD(ER) Task Force will eventually make recommendations that, when adopted, will cause many of the descriptions below to change. The goal of this exercise is NOT to show ideal cataloguing for digital materials, however, but to examine where current AACR2R is deficient when cataloguing items with multiple characteristics.

**Serially issued scores:**


15 v. of music ; 28 cm.

Two or 3 issues a year.

**Problems identified:**

1. Does 5.5B require that the scores be counted if the item is a serial?

**Manuscript score:**

[In hellen Traumen hab ich Dich oft geschaut] [manuscript music] / [Arnold Schönberg]. – 1893.

1 ms. Score ([4] leaves) ; 35 cm.

Holograph fair copy.

For high voice and piano.

Title from text.

German words by Alfred Gold.

Written in black ink on the rectos of two double leaves. The original date of the score has faded from p. [1]. The score is signed on p. [4]. Corrections appear throughout, either in pencil or in black ink. The versos of each leaf are blank.

**Problems identified:**

1. Which GMD is “predominant” (1.1C4), manuscript or music? Is one more “physical” than the other according to rule 0.24?

2. Special rule 4.1F3 (supply statement of responsibility) would overrule general rule 1.1F2 (do not supply statements of responsibility), right?
**Electronic serial**


Electronic newsletter in HTML and ASCII formats.

Irregular.


Continues: CONSER : [newsletter]

Mode of access: Internet email, telnet, gopher, and World Wide Web. For email subscription, send to: listserv@loc.gov, the message: subscribe consrlin [firstname lastname].

Electronic location:

gopher://marvel.loc.gov/11/services/cataloging/coop/conser/CONSERline

URL: http://lcweb.loc.gov/acq/conser/consrlin.html

Note: This example was catalogued according to the CONSER guidelines.

**Problems identified:**

1. **Chapter 9 calls for the Nature and scope and system requirements note to come first, but chapter 12 calls for the frequency note to come first...**

**Etext available on the internet**

Andreoni, James.


System requirements: Adobe Acrobat Reader.


Title from initial page of PDF file. Viewed on: April 8, 1999.

“Issued in September 1998.”

Document formatted into pages and illustrated; contains 20 pages.


Problems identified:
1. The physical description is omitted for remote access materials, yet this PDF format document is stable at 20 pages and is ill.
2. Online, there are now two candidates for chief source—the first page with the abstract (which gives the series as ‘NBER working paper no. W6739’) which is hotlinked to the PDF file, and the first page of the PDF file itself (which gives the series as ‘NBER working paper series’ and ‘Working paper 6739’). Ain’t life grand? Follow 9.0B1 and prefer the source with the most complete information?

Efilm available on the internet

Silent actuality short available in MPEG and Quick Time formats.
System requirements: To view films in the MPEG format, you should have a high-end, high-speed computer (such as a Pentium 90 (or better) with a PCI or AGP graphics card and .mpg playback software, or a PowerMac with .mpg playback software.
Originally produced and released by Thomas A. Edison, Inc. in 1901.
Footage was shot by Edwin S. Porter and James H. White, according to the description at the American Memory site at the Library of Congress.
Silent, b&w; playing time, 1 min., 26 sec.
Summary: The film, photographed from a single camera position, shows in a 360-degree pan buildings at the Pan-American Exposition in Buffalo, New York, as spectators stroll past the camera. Buildings and sites shown probably include the Transportation Building, the Mexican Plaza, the Stadium, and the north side of the Electric Tower.
LC call number: LC 1533 (paper pos)
Digital ID: (m) lcmp001 m1b02879.
Safety positive print. In Paper Print Collection, Motion Picture, Broadcasting and Recorded Sound Division, Library of Congress.
Copyright: Thomas A. Edison; 14Aug1901; H7633.
Electronic location: Electronic format types: MPEG and Quick Time – File size: 13,367,364 bytes (MPEG) or 6,381,308 bytes (Quick Time) – URL: http://memory.loc.gov/ammem/edhtml/edhome.html
Problems identified:
1. Which GMD is “predominant” (1.1C4), motion picture or computer file? Is one more “physical” than the other according to rule 0.24? Is a motion picture that can be viewed over the Internet really best identified as a `computer file’? Isn’t the fact that this is a motion picture equally interesting to users? Can a remote access computer file really be more “physical” than a motion picture, such that rules 0.24 and 1.1C4 require it to be considered “predominant”?
2. The area 3 duplicates the GMD, clutters up the record, and is confusing rather than helpful. Most users would probably not think of this motion picture as representing “computer data.” The number of bytes for a large image file like this IS useful, however. Since this record represents both the MPEG and Quick Time format variants, however, can both byte counts be included here?
3. The physical description is omitted for remote access materials, yet this is still a silent, b&w motion picture that lasts for 1 minute 26 seconds.

Questions about digital cataloguing, unrelated to rule 0.24
1. How do you determine the date of publication for a web site? Take the last revision date from the bottom of the page?
2. Can the appearance on the title screen of the name of the original producer in a copyright statement be transcribed as a statement of responsibility?
3. How do you indicate in the 856 field that once you get to the site, you must search for the title?
4. Is it still important to have a date viewed note, when this is not a continuously updating item?

Map collection on CD ROM
8 computer optical discs : sd., col. ; 4 3/4 + 1 user’s guide.
System requirements: Windows 95 or Windows 98; 486/66 MHz or faster processor; 16 MB RAM; 40 MB free space; SVGA video card supporting 256 colors; 16 bit sound card and speakers; 2x CD-ROM drive.
Title from container.
Title from title bar: National geographic interactive.
Also known as: National Geographic maps on CD-ROM.
Summary: An archive of every foldout map that has accompanied National Geographic magazine during its first 109 years. Interactive map tours and time lines introduce the user to a rich collection of more than 500 maps.

Note: Cataloguing derived from OCLC copy.
Problems identified:
1. Which GMD is “predominant” (1.1C4), map or computer file? Is one more “physical” than the other according to rule 0.24? Note the fact that the decision about the GMD (carrier over content) is in conflict with the MARC 21 leader byte 6 coding decision (content over carrier).
2. There is very little mathematical and other cartographic data in this record, but perhaps that would be true of any such collection of maps, digital or otherwise?
3. The Chapter 9 area 3 seems very redundant next to the GMD.

Game on CD ROM:

Pirates captain's quest [computer file] : the history adventure game where you’re the captain. – Version 1.0. – Computer data and program. – Indianapolis, IN : Discovery Channel Multimedia, c1996.
1 computer optical disc : sd., col. ; 4 3/4 in. + 1 user’s guide (11 p. : col. Ill. ; 12 cm.) + 1 icon card.
System requirements for Windows: 486/50MHz or faster; 8MB RAM; MS DOS 3.1; Windows 3.0 or Windows 95; double-speed CD-ROM drive; VGA monitor, 256-colors; Windows compatible sound card; mouse.
System requirements for Macintosh: Performa, Centris, Quadra or Power Mac (native); 8MB RAM; System 7.0 or greater; double-speed CD-ROM drive; VGA monitor, 256-colors.
Title and ed. Statement from disc label.
Intended audience: Ages 9 and up.
Summary: Each time you play this interactive adventure game, you are given a new pirate mission to solve. Teaches lessons in history, geography and social studies.

Note: Cataloguing derived from OCLC copy.

Problems identified:
1. Which GMD is “predominant” (1.1C4), game or computer file? Is one more “physical” than the other according to rule 0.24? If only the computer file GMD is used (probably what would actually be done under AACR2R as written), and chapter 9 is followed for the physical description, the fact that this is a game is not revealed until you get to the summary note. (Note that if chapter 10 rules for physical description were used, the SMD would be ‘1 game.’ Also note that it is just a matter of luck that this particular game uses term ‘game’ in its subtitle.)
2. The scope statement in Chapter 10 seems to imply that all games, to be considered games, must be three-dimensional? Since this is not three-dimensional, it can’t in fact be a game?

Acknowledgements: Thanks to Kathryn P. Glennan for music examples.
Electronic journal example from CONSER web site.
5. Objectives for the Rule 0.24 Revision Process

At the Annual Meeting of 1998, the Task Force held a brainstorming session, and agreed upon the following goals for our work on rule 0.24:

**Goal 1.** Clarity for cataloguers in deciding how to formulate a description for an item with multiple characteristics.

**Goal 2.** Clarity for cataloguers in determining when two similar items should be described on two different bibliographic records.

**Goal 3.** Clarity for both the public and for cataloguers about what the object of a bibliographic record is, or about what a record represents (i.e., whether it represents a particular edition/expression or a particular manifestation).

**Goal 4.** The outcome of our work must agree with the principles of AACR2 as determined by the Joint Steering Committee.

**Goal 5.** The outcome of our work must be a code that is expansible to cover new materials.

**Goal 6.** Clear decision-making for cataloguers cataloguing an item with multiple characteristics when a particular rule for one aspect of the item conflicts with the same rule for another aspect of the item.

**Goal 7.** Practices that clearly express to the public the situation in which two items represent the same edition/expression of the same work and differ only in carrier; the clarity of expression should be tested by means of user studies.

**Goal 8.** Rules that produce exchangeable records.

It should be noted that there was a lot of support for avoiding assigning primacy to one manifestation among several that all represent the same edition/expression of the same work, i.e., for moving away from the idea of “the original.”

And finally, the need to maintain conformity between AACR2 and the ISBD’s was noted, although it was not clear what the implications of this were for our work on rule 0.24. It was noted that the division into AACR2R’s chapters 1-13 does not correspond perfectly now to the division into the various ISBD’s that have been published (ISBD(NBM) is represented by several chapters in AACR2R, for example), and that it should be possible to reorganize the chapters and still produce ISBD-based descriptions with the same elements of description in the same order as at present (See Appendix E).
6. Options to Deal with Multiple Characteristics

Option 1 to deal with multiple characteristics. Simply modify the language of 0.24, leaving the current chapters in AACR2R intact.

The specific recommendation is: Retain rule 0.24 and modify its language along the lines suggested below. Leave the current chapters 1-11 of AACR2 in the order they now are and with their texts essentially intact. Expand existing chapters (or write additional chapters) as necessary to provide for electronic resources, digitized and microform reproductions and originals. For electronic resources indicate that when a bibliographic item is remotely accessed on a computer, the description can be based on the observed or otherwise known characteristics of the item. Add, however it is deemed best, a discussion of integrating resources.

Proposed text for rule 0.24 to support option 1 to deal with multiple characteristics:

It is a central principle of the use of part I that description should be based first on one of three forms of issuance: monograph, serial, or integrating entity, and subsequently on the other chapters in part I (chapters 2-11) which collectively represent classes of materials which share certain common characteristics. After form of issuance has been determined, choose the chapter (class of materials) most applicable in describing the item and in determining the chief source of information as necessary to make it clear to the user of the bibliographic record what the item looks like physically and what its contains. For items made up of several types of material, see 1.10. For items with multiple characteristics, cataloging agencies or user groups may determine what characteristics should receive preferential consideration in the descriptive sequence.

In addition, it is recommended that the following definitions be added to the glossary:

Class of materials. A class of materials constitutes any of several bibliographic groups having similar characteristics which differentiate one group of materials from another. These characteristics require members of these groups to be catalogued with attention to their unique shared characteristics. The major classes are: textual materials (books, pamphlets and printed sheets and the texts of serials); cartographic materials; manuscripts; music; sound recordings; motion pictures and
videorecordings; graphic materials; electronic resources; three dimensional artefacts and realia; and microforms.

**Bibliographic item.** A bibliographic item forms the basis for a bibliographic description. A bibliographic item may be perceived directly through either sight, sound, or touch, or a combination thereof.

**Integrating entity.** An integrating entity is a bibliographic item issued with the potential for seamless integration of new data into the content (e.g., looseleaf services, online databases and some Web sites).

**Pro's:** Option 1 would require less change to the rules than Option 2.

- Option 1 may correspond more closely than Option 2 to the way cataloguing departments are organized.
- Option 1 may correspond more closely than Option 2 to the training needs of departments that train specialized cataloguers, such as music cataloguers or serials cataloguers.

**Con's:** Does not meet Goal 1, clarity for cataloguers in deciding how to formulate a description for an item with multiple characteristics, as well as Option 2 does.

- Does not meet Goal 5, a code that is expansible to cover new materials, as well as Option 2 does.
- Does not meet Goal 6, clear decision-making for cataloguers cataloguing an item with multiple characteristics when a particular rule for one aspect of the item conflicts with the same rule for another aspect of the item, as well as Option 2 does.

**Option 2 to deal with multiple characteristics.** Reorganize the current chapters 1-13 such that they are in order by the areas of the description, with a chapter on Area 1, a chapter on Area 2, etc., as recommended in the Delsey report, Part I. Within each chapter, include special rules to deal with conditions arising out of:

a. form of issuance (seriality vs. one-time publication vs. integrating/dynamic updating)

b. published vs. unpublished
c. fundamental content (textual/alpha-numeric content, textual/alpha-numeric sound, musical notation, musical sound, other sound, moving image content, graphic content, spatial/cartographic/geographic content, 3-dimensional content/artefact/object, computer program, mixed)

d. ‘type of carrier’ or physical format, i.e. the physical medium onto which the fundamental content has been put in order to distribute it

e. method of management (library vs. archival/collection level records based on provenance)

f. reproduction (same physical format/different physical format; simultaneously released-successively released such that there is an “original”)

Note that a change in the organization of chapters in AACR2R would also require revision of rule 0.23, as well as slight revision to rules 0.25 and 0.26 to remove references to chapters.

Proposed text for rule 0.24 to support option 2 to deal with multiple characteristics:

It is important to bring out all aspects of the item being described, including its content, its carrier, its form of issuance, its relationship to other manifestations of the same edition/expression of the same work, and whether it is published or unpublished. In any given area of the description, all relevant aspects should be described, with no one relevant aspect taking precedence over any other. When descriptive rules governing a particular ISBD area address more than one aspect of an item and differ or seem to be in conflict as a result, the rules themselves will provide guidance on how to combine information about these aspects. General rules are followed by specific rules for the aspects of an item, so as a rule of thumb, the cataloguer should follow the more specific rules applying to the item being catalogued, whenever they differ from the general rules.

Experiments in reorganization

In Appendix B of this document, you will find Martha Yee’s attempt to demonstrate what a reorganization of AACR2R by ISBD area might look like; basically, she brought together all of the current rules concerning Area 1 and put them in one place. At the following web site, you will find John Attig’s experiment with reorganizing Area 2.

http://www.libraries.psu.edu/iasweb/personal/jca/ccda/area2.html
And finally, we would like to point out that Michael Gorman’s *Concise AACR2* (The concise AACR2, 1988 revision / prepared by Michael Gorman. Chicago: ALA, 1989) is organized by ISBD area, rather than by “class of material”.

We discussed the fact that neither option 1 nor option 2 can rid us of the problem of potential conflicts in rules for items with multiple characteristics. Such conflicts will occur and will have to be resolved in either case. Supporters of Option 2 just feel that the reorganization option gives us greater flexibility to resolve such conflicts where they occur, and in such a way as to allow the inclusion of information about all relevant aspects of the item in the description, without the rigidity of a table of precedence imposed from above.

We did identify some specific conflicts in rules that will occur with multiple-characteristic items, and that will demand resolution under either option. These include:

1. **Source of title.** Resolution of such conflict is likely to require negotiation among form of issuance aspects (seriality), carrier aspects (where is the title usually found on this type of carrier?) and content aspects (e.g. special rules for music). Jean Hirons’ report already points the way to the types of solutions that could be tried in her recommendation 2-4, in which different chief sources are proposed for electronic journals (A—entire source), databases and web sites (B—title screen, home page, main menu or other prominent page), direct access electronic resources (C—eye-readable information on the disc label), and loose-leaf publications (D—title page or title page substitute).

2. **GMD’s** (covered in a special section below).

3. **Area 2.** Edition statements would have to be transcribed differently depending on whether or not an item is determined to be a serial or not (i.e. based on form of issuance).

4. **Area 3.** This has been addressed already by AACR2R in rule 0.25, which allows you to add as many as apply.

5. **Area 5.** This area is likely to be carrier-dominated, but content is described here as well (e.g. playing time (which, by the way, is connected with edition/expression), and nature of color and sound for a motion picture). If description of content aspects could be divorced from particular carriers, it might be possible to create much more flexible rules, such that anything, regardless of carrier, that had a playing time could have the playing time added, anything that had color and/or stereo. Sound could have the color and/or stereo. Sound described, etc.
It is likely, however, that conflicts will have to be adjudicated over time as the reorganized rules are applied to more and more different types of material and conflicts arise.

**Pro's:** One could argue that Option 2 is based on a facet analysis of AACR2R’s chapters, in an attempt to correct the cross-classification that is evident when one tries to catalogue a digitized manuscript map.

This approach could allow the cataloguer the freedom to describe all aspects of an item effectively, including its content, its carrier, and its publication type. This should aid in achieving Goal 1, clarity for cataloguers in deciding how to formulate a description for an item with multiple characteristics, and Goal 6, clear decision-making for cataloguers cataloguing an item with multiple characteristics when a particular rule for one aspect of an item conflicts with the same rule for another aspect of the item.

It could also allow greater flexibility in fashioning descriptions for new types of content and/or carrier that might appear on the bibliographic horizon in the future. This should aid in achieving Goal 5, a code that is expandable to cover new materials. (The scope notes of the current content and carrier-based chapters of AACR2R can form a barrier that prevents the cataloguer of new media from using all relevant descriptive rules.)

Option 2 releases cataloguers from the obligation to designate one aspect primary over the others. Option 2 does not apply one inflexible rule, e.g., form of issuance always takes precedence over content or carrier, or content always takes precedence over carrier or vice versa; instead, it would be possible to resolve conflicts differently in different areas of the description, allowing the inclusion of all relevant descriptive elements, instead of forcing the use of one relevant data element over another. This should aid in achieving Goal 1, clarity for cataloguers in deciding how to formulate a description for an item with multiple characteristics, and Goal 6, clear decision-making for cataloguers cataloguing an item with multiple characteristics when a particular rule for one aspect of an item conflicts with the same rule for another aspect of the item.

---

3 We note, however, that there is no escaping the need to deal with such conflicts; this organization simply provides a more efficient way to discover them and deal with them in the rules.

4 Note that when a special rule is written for a particular type of carrier, a particular type of content, or a particular publication type, care should be taken to write scope notes for the rule that are as principled and flexible as possible, to prevent inadvertent exclusion of new types of content, carrier or publication type in the future.

5 Note that MARC 21 still requires the cataloguer to designate one aspect as primary, in that a principal material type must be chosen for coding purposes, leader 6 and 7 being linked to the kind of 008 field that is used (see Appendix G); due to format integration, however, the descriptive part of the record can now describe all aspects of an item.
decision-making for cataloguers cataloguing an item with multiple characteristics when a particular rule for one aspect of an item conflicts with the same rule for another aspect of the item. Presumably, this could also result in a more useful description for the public.

Option 2 could result in greater consistency among cataloguers with many different types of expertise cataloguing materials with many types of carrier, content and publication type.

Option 2 is similar to format integration, and thus continues a trend toward a more logical approach to content and carrier, as well as to new formats. The principle could simply be: if the rule is relevant to the item you are cataloguing, it is permissible to use the rule. In other words, the structure and scoping of the chapters would no longer prevent the use of relevant rules.

Appendix D, a quick study of where the rules in any given ISBD area differ based on class of material in current AACR2R, reveals that, depending on the area of description you examine, each different aspect of a given item (its content, or its carrier, or its publication type) is sometimes given precedence in the rules for its description. This would seem to indicate a fairly complex relationship among these three aspects of any given item, which argues against the possibility of any simple rules of precedence being possible in rule 0.24. Instead, reorganization would allow these complex relationships to be stated in the rules themselves, with content sometimes given precedence, carrier sometimes, and form of issuance sometimes.

It is possible that reorganization of the rules could result in the identification of general descriptive rules that have not yet been identified as general, and have been masquerading as special rules; this could improve the overall logic of the code, as well as making it more extensible to new media.

Con’s: Option 2 may not correspond to the way all cataloguing departments are organized.

Option 2 may not correspond to the training needs of departments that train specialized cataloguers, such as music cataloguers, media cataloguers or serials cataloguers. It might be difficult to train a music, media or serials cataloguer using rules organized by ISBD area.

The descriptive rules might become complicated, as each area chapter examines and treats each medium for variation based on its physical nature, form of issuance, content, and other characteristics.
Option 3 to deal with multiple characteristics. Reverse the order of AACR2R chapters 1-13, with precedence being given to chapters that occur first in order, placing content chapters ahead of carrier or form of issuance chapters.

Proposed order of chapters:

1. Textual Materials (currently chapters 2, Books, Pamphlets and Printed Sheets, and 4, Manuscripts (Including Manuscript Collections))
2. Cartographic Materials (currently chapter 3)
3. Motion Pictures and Videorecordings (currently chapter 7)
4. Graphic Materials (currently chapter 8)
5. Three-Dimensional Artefacts and Realia (currently chapter 10)
6. Music (currently chapter 5)
7. Sound Recordings (currently chapter 6)
8. Microforms (currently chapter 11)
9. Computer Files (currently chapter 9)
10. Serials (currently chapter 12)

Note that a change in the organization of chapters in AACR2R would also require revision of rule 0.23, as well as slight revision to rules 0.25 and 0.26 to correct references to chapters.

Proposed text for rule 0.24 to support option 3 to deal with multiple characteristics:

It is a cardinal principle of the use of part I that the description of [an item] should be based in the first instance on the chapter dealing with the class of materials to which that item belongs. […] There will be need in many instances to consult [several chapters in order to deal with all aspects of the item, including its content, its carrier and its publication type. When rules in several chapters conflict, give precedence to the chapter that occurs first in order.]

(Non-bracketed text is already present in AACR2R.)
**Pro’s:** Option 3 would require less change in the rules than Option 2.

Option 3 may correspond more closely than Option 2 to the way some cataloguing departments are organized.

Option 3 may correspond more closely than Option 2 to the training needs of departments that train specialized cataloguers, such as music cataloguers or serials cataloguers.

**Con’s:** Does not meet Goal 1, clarity for cataloguers in deciding how to formulate a description for an item with multiple characteristics, as well as Option 2 does.

Does not meet Goal 5, a code that is expansible to cover new materials, as well as Option 2 does.

Does not meet Goal 6, clear decision-making for cataloguers cataloguing an item with multiple characteristics when a particular rule for one aspect of the item conflicts with the same rule for another aspect of the item, as well as Option 2 does.

**Option 4 to deal with multiple characteristics.** Use a phased approach, consisting of Option 1 in the short term, to allow fairly immediate guidance for the cataloguing of electronic serials and other electronic resources, and Option 2 in the long term, moving eventually to a code that is organized by ISBD area.

**Pro’s:** This could allow us to have the best of both worlds—immediate relief for cataloguers who need to know NOW how to catalogue electronic resources, especially electronic serials, and eventual movement toward a more logically organized code that is easier for cataloguers to use for the cataloguing of items with multiple characteristics. (Also see all of the pro’s and con’s listed under Options 1 and 2 above.)
7. Options to Deal with Format Variations

If it is decided to pursue one of the options described below that calls for two variant manifestations of the same edition/expression of the same work to be described using a single record (options 2-4), a number of techniques might be employed.

1. The single record could describe what is common to all manifestations represented by that record, and leave out any reference to the variations.

2. The single record could summarize the variations in manifestations represented by the record in the notes or in repeatable physical description fields or both; ideally, multiple fields applying to one manifestation could be linked in some fashion.

3. The single record could describe only what is common to all manifestations represented by the record, with variations between manifestations described in subrecords.

4. The single record could be a multilevel description (rule 13.6 in AACR2R) in which what is common to all manifestations represented by the record is described at the top level of the record, and the variations between manifestations are described in the next level down.

5. The code could prescribe a virtual single record display that was actually constructed by pulling information from multiple underlying bibliographic records.

It may not be appropriate for the code to specify which of the above techniques should in fact be used to produce the display recommended by the code. Rather the code should recommend the standard display and leave it up to systems to choose the optimum technique for producing that display.

**Option 1 to deal with format variations.** Simply modify the language of 0.24, leaving the rest of AACR2R intact. For example, the notion of ‘physical’ could be removed from the wording of 0.24, and the examples could be changed so that it is permissible to base the description on an original rather than a reproduction when that is possible without research into the nature of the original.
Proposed text for rule 0.24 to support option 1 to deal with format variations:

It is a cardinal principle of the use of part I that the description of an item should be based in the first instance on the chapter dealing with the class of materials to which that item belongs. It is permissible to base the description on an original rather than a reproduction when that is possible without research into the nature of the original.

**Pro’s:** Option 1 requires that less text be added to AACR2R than any of the other options.

Option 1 would codify the practice that is actually being followed in many libraries for preservation microfilming and digitization projects. These practices are likely to become more and more widespread with the development of digital library initiatives.

Option 1 would be sure to meet Goal 8, in that it would lead to the production of exchangable records.

**Con’s:** Option 1 would involve costs, as well as dysjunctions between older and newer records.

Option 1 would not meet Goal 3, clarity for both the public and for cataloguers about what the object of a bibliographic record is, or about what a record represents (i.e., whether it represents a particular edition/expression or a particular manifestation). Separate records would be made both for different edition/expressions of the same work, and for different manifestations of the same edition/expression of the same work.

Option 1 would require cataloguer’s judgment. There would be times when Goal 2, clarity for catalogers in determining when two similar items should be described on two different bibliographic records, might not be met, although research should be done to determine how frequently that might occur. One suspects it would not occur often.

Option 1 would not meet Goal 9 in that it would not clearly express to the public the situation in which two items represent the same edition/expression of the same work and differ only in carrier.
Option 2 to deal with format variations. Reconcile and codify current practice, as found in OCLC guidelines, CONSER guidelines, and LCRI 1.0.

Note: The following recommended text for Option 2 has been edited down considerably from the OCLC guidelines because it was not felt necessary to refer so explicitly to differences in cataloguing practice either over time or from institution to institution.

Note also that these rules follow both current AACR2R and OCLC, rather than LC, with regard to format changes, such as from text to microfilm.

Proposed text for rule 0.24 to support option 2 to deal with format variations:

1. Create a new record for each different edition/expression or manifestation of a monographic work.

   Consider that a new edition/expression is involved whenever

   a) there is an explicit indication of changes (including corrections) of content [LCRI 1.0]; or,

   b) anything in the following areas or elements of areas differs:
      title and statement of responsibility area [LCRI 1.0]
      edition area (with the exceptions noted below) [LCRI 1.0]
      extent statement or specific material designation in the physical description area [LCRI 1.0, OCLC]
      technical details for nonprint materials in the physical description area, such as sound or color characteristics, playing speed, number of channels of sound, etc. [OCLC]
      dimensions in the physical description area [OCLC]
      series area [LCRI 1.0] (with the exceptions noted below)
      system requirements note [OCLC]

   Do not create a new record if the only variation is minor variation in one or more of the following areas:

   edition area

   EXAMPLES OF MINOR VARIATIONS:
   absence or presence of “book club edition,” “paperback edition,” or “first edition” statements [OCLC]
   absence or presence of edition statements appearing on some foreign language publications (e.g., Romance language imprints) that
reflect printing information rather than edition/expression information. If the edition statement appears in conjunction with the printer’s name or the number of copies printed, generally consider the edition statement to reflect printing information [OCLC]

publication/distribution area

EXAMPLES OF MINOR VARIATIONS:
variation in the form of the name of the place of publication (e.g., Cologne vs. Koln) [OCLC]
change of place within the same country between printings of the same edition/expression [OCLC]
change of place among issues or parts of a multipart item [OCLC]
variation in multiple places of publication as long as the first place is the same (e.g., an item published in Denmark may show only Kobenhavn, but the same item issued in the U.S. shows Kobenhavn and Philadelphia) [OCLC]
variation in fullness of the publisher’s name [LCRI 1.0, OCLC]
change of publisher among issues or parts of a multipart item [OCLC]
absence or presence of multiple publishers, distributors, etc., as long as one on the item matches one on the record, and vice versa [OCLC]
absence or presence of a publication or copyright date [OCLC]
variation in printing, manufacture, or distribution date alone [LCRI 1.0, OCLC]
variation in copyright dates if the publication dates are the same [LCRI 1.0, OCLC]

physical description area

EXAMPLES OF MINOR VARIATIONS:
variation in preliminary paging, post paging, or separate numbering [OCLC]
a difference in dimensions of less than 2 cm. For a book, serial or printed music item [OCLC]
a difference in binding [LCRI 1.0, OCLC]

series area

EXAMPLES OF MINOR VARIATIONS:
change of series among issues or parts of a multipart item [OCLC]
absence, presence, or difference in series statement of responsibility [OCLC]
EXAMPLES OF MINOR VARIATIONS:
   the addition, deletion, or change of an ISBN or other standard
   number [LCRI 1.0, OCLC]

2. Create a new record for each incarnation of a serial work.

   Consider that a new incarnation is involved whenever

   a) The title changes [rule 21.2A1 and 21.2C]

   b) The corporate main entry changes [rule 21.3B1]

   c) The corporate body used as a qualifier in the uniform title changes

   d) The serial work is translated or issued in a language edition/expression

   e) The serial’s enumeration repeats the exact numeric designation and the publisher does not link the old and new systems with a designation such as “new series” or “second series” [LCRI 12.3G]

   f) the physical format in which a serial work is issued changes [LCRI 21.3Bd]

Do not create a new record if the only variation is one or more of the following:

   minor title variations among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work, including variation in order of titles in different languages, variation in titles other than the title proper; (consider moving relevant parts of rule 21.2A1 and 21.2C here, or referring to them from here)

   minor variations in responsible entities among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work; (consider moving relevant parts of rule 21.3B1 here, or referring to it from here)

   change of frequency among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work

   change of place among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work

   change of publisher among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work

   change of series among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work
3. All changes to an integrating work should be described on one latest-entry record (current practice for loose-leaf publications).

**Pro's:** Option 2 would not involve costs, or dysjunctions between older and newer records.

Option 2 would codify the practice that is actually being followed by most libraries, except with regard to preservation microfilms and digitization projects.

Option 2 would be sure to meet Goal 8, in that it would lead to the production of exchangable records.

**Con's:** Option 2 would require cataloguer’s judgment. There would be times when Goal 2, clarity for cataloguers in determining when two similar items should be described on two different bibliographic records, might not be met, although research should be done to determine how frequently that might occur. One suspects it would not occur often.

Option 2 would not meet Goal 3, clarity for both the public and for cataloguers about what the object of a bibliographic record is, or about what a record represents (i.e., whether it represents a particular edition/expressions or a particular manifestation). Separate records would be made both for different edition/expressions of the same work, and for different manifestations of the same edition/expressions of the same work.

Option 2 would not meet Goal 9 in that it would not clearly express to the public the situation in which two items represent the same edition/expression of the same work and differ only in carrier.

**Option 3 to deal with format variations.** Codify the MULVER guidelines (limiting single record for multiple versions practice to reproductions only).

Note that options 3-4 would require that the definition of ‘edition’ in AACR2R be reworked to be more in conformity with the definition of ‘expression’ in FRBR. (See Appendix C).

---

Proposed text for rule 0.24 to support option 3 to deal with format variations:

Create a new record for each different edition/expression or manifestation of a work (see Option 2), except in the case of manifestations created through reproduction (i.e., with identical content), including cases in which the physical carrier varies.

The following are examples of manifestations created through reproduction:

- photocopies
- microform copies
- reprints which are not being considered as distinct edition/expressions
- reproductions of full or partial runs of serials and multipart items
- tape dubs of sound recordings and moving image materials
- photomechanical or photographic copies of graphic materials
- computer files produced by optical scanning of a printed original

Do not consider the following to be examples of manifestations created through reproduction:

- reprints containing significant intellectual alterations or additions
- simultaneous publications, including US and international edition/expressions of printed items where it is impossible to identify the original
- reissues of sound recordings in the same or a different format
- sound or video recordings issued simultaneously in more than one format
- two-dimensional copies of three-dimensional materials
- materials issued simultaneously in print and in electronic formats

**Pro’s:** Option 3 would codify the practice that is actually being followed in many libraries for preservation microfilming and digitization projects. These practices are likely to become more and more widespread with the development of digital library initiatives.

**Con’s:** Option 3 would involve costs, as well as dysjunctions between older and newer records.

Option 3 would require cataloguer’s judgment. There would be times when Goal 2, clarity for cataloguers in determining when two similar items should be described on two different bibliographic records, might not be met, although research should be done to determine how frequently that might occur. One suspects it would not occur often.
Option 3 would meet Goal 3 only for reproductions, goal 3 being clarity for both the public and for cataloguers about what the object of a bibliographic record is, or about what a record represents (i.e., whether it represents a particular edition/expression or a particular manifestation). Separate records would be made both for different edition/expressions of the same work, and for different manifestations of the same edition/expression of the same work when the latter were not reproductions.

Option 3 would meet Goal 9 only for reproductions, in that in cases other than reproductions, it would not clearly express to the public the situation in which two items represent the same edition/expression of the same work and differ only in carrier.

It might be more difficult to meet Goal 8, in that, depending on the underlying record structure, Option 3 might make the production of exchangable records more complex.

**Option 4 to deal with format variations.** Extend to all materials the ISBD(ER) approach of ignoring minor physical variations in manifestation or carrier. Do not ignore physical variation at or above the SMD level.

Note that options 3-5 would require that the definition of ‘edition’ in AACR2R be reworked to be more in conformity with the definition of ‘expression’ in FRBR (See [Appendix C](#)).

**Proposed text for rule 0.24 to support option 4 to deal with format variations:**

1. Create a new record for each different edition/expression of a monographic work.

Consider that a new edition/expression is involved whenever
   a) There is any change in statement of responsibility or credits (new statements of subsidiary authorship)
   b) There is any change in edition statement that indicates a substantive change in the underlying edition/expression
   c) There is any change in extent
   d) There is addition of illustrations, maps, bibliographies or other supplementary material not present in other edition/expressions
   e) There is an explicit indication of changes (including corrections) of content; includes changes in contents notes
   f) There is any change in language of the work
Changes in the marks of identification that are important enough to treat as a change in edition/expression (‘title-expression?’ ‘title-edition?’) even if there is no change in the underlying edition/expression:

a) Change in title or subtitle
b) Change in series
c) Change in the form of the statement of responsibility or credits?

Changes in the carrier that are important enough to treat as a change in manifestation, even if there is no change in the underlying edition/expression:

a) Difference in the programming language
b) Changes to upgrade or improve the efficiency of the resource
c) Modifications in the programming language or operating system that allow the resource to be compatible with other machines and operating systems

Do not create a new record if the only variation is in one or more of the following areas:

Note: If any of these changes occur in conjunction with changes listed above, they should be noted in the new bibliographic record that results. However, if they occur in isolation, not associated with any change in the underlying edition/expression or manifestation, they should not cause the creation of a new record.

a) A difference in the type of physical carrier (e.g. from disk to cassette) and/or the size of the physical carrier (e.g. 14 cm. to 9 cm. disk)

b) Differences in printer-related file formats (e.g. ASCII vs. PostScript)

c) Differences in system-related formats (e.g. IBM vs. Macintosh)
d) Differences relating to the character code or to blocking or recording densities
e) Differences in the output medium or display format (e.g. a remote access resource reproduced on floppy disk and optical disk)

The Subgroup on Option 1 for Multiple Characteristics propose the following wording for rule 0.24 to support the ISBD(ER) approach:

An edition is considered to consist of all copies produced from substantially the same master copy for all bibliographic items. Not to be considered a new edition are minor changes to the content of the item or changes to the formatting, such as corrections of misspellings of data, changes in the arrangement of the contents, most changes in the type and size of physical carrier, and for electronic resources, changes in system-
related format, differences in display or output formats, technical differences relating to character code, blocking, or density. See chapters 2-12 for details.

Discussion:

Note that the GMD and SMD levels in AACR2R are not set in a very principled manner. The change between motion picture and videorecording (at the GMD level) is actually equivalent to the change between sound disc and sound cassette (at the SMD level). Also, codification of current practice regarding preservation microfilming and digital library projects would require describing change at the GMD level (‘microform’ or ‘computer file/electronic resource’ vs. ‘text’) on a single record.

Also note that changes in physical description below the GMD and SMD levels can signify change in edition/expression, as in the difference between the sound and the silent version of a film released at the time of the changeover from silent to sound films, or as in the case of an illustrated edition of a text, or as in the case of two different edition/expressions of a work that vary only in extent, e.g. a film version that has a scene restored that was censored from the original release version.

Proposed text for rule 0.24 to support option 4 to deal with format variations (cont.):

2. Create a new record for each incarnation of a serial work.

Consider that a new incarnation is involved whenever

a) The title changes
b) The corporate main entry changes
c) The corporate body used as a qualifier in the uniform title changes
d) The serial work is translated or issued in a language edition/expression
e) The serial’s enumeration repeats the exact numeric designation and the publisher does not link the old and new systems with a designation such as “new series” or “second series”
f) There is change in geographic coverage

Do not create a new record if the only variation is one or more of the following:
Note: If any of these changes occur in conjunction with changes listed above, they should be noted in the new bibliographic record that results. However, if they occur in isolation, not associated with any change in the underlying incarnation, they should not cause the creation of a new record.

a) Minor title variations among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work, including variation in order of titles in different languages, variation in titles other than the title proper, etc.
b) Minor variations in responsible entities among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work
c) Change of frequency among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work
d) Change in place of publication among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work
e) Change in publisher or distributor among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work
f) Change in manifestation or carrier, e.g., change from audiocassette to CD, or from text to microform, or from text to digitized text, or from col. to b&w
g) Difference in paper, typography or binding
h) Difference in presence or absence of closed captioning

3. All changes to an integrating work should be described on one latest-entry record.

**Pro’s:** Option 4 would sometimes meet Goal 3, clarity for both the public and for cataloguers about what the object of a bibliographic record is, or about what a record represents (i.e., whether it represents a particular edition/expression or a particular manifestation), but see below under con’s. Separate records would be made for different edition/expressions of the same work, but the same record would sometimes be used for different manifestations of the same edition/expression of the same work.

Option 4 would sometimes meet Goal 9 in that it would sometimes clearly express to the public the situation in which two items represent the same edition/expression of the same work and differ only in carrier, but see below under con’s.

**Con’s:** Option 4 would involve costs, as well as dysjunctions between older and newer records.

Option 4 would require cataloguer’s judgment. There would be times when Goal 2, clarity for cataloguers in determining when two similar items should be described on two different bibliographic records, might not be
met, although research should be done to determine how frequently that might occur. One suspects it would not occur often.

It might be more difficult to meet Goal 8, in that, depending on the underlying record structure, Option 4, might make the production of exchangeable records more complex.

Option 4 would meet Goal 3 only in certain cases, goal 3 being clarity for both the public and for cataloguers about what the object of a bibliographic record is, or about what a record represents (i.e., whether it represents a particular edition/expression or a particular manifestation). Separate records would be made both for different edition/expressions of the same work, and for different manifestations of the same edition/expression of the same work, when the latter did not fall into the categories identified by ISBD(ER).

Option 4 would meet Goal 9 only in certain cases, in that it would clearly express to the public the situation in which two items represent the same edition/expression of the same work and differ only in carrier only when those items fall into the categories identified by ISBD(ER).

Option 4 would not codify the practice that is actually being followed in many libraries for preservation microfilming and digitization projects. These practices are likely to become more and more widespread with the development of digital library initiatives.

**Option 5 to deal with format variations.** Extend to all materials the ISBD(ER) approach of ignoring minor variations. Ignore any mere physical variation or any mere variation in distribution information (i.e. any manifestation variation).

Note that options 3-5 would require that the definition of ‘edition’ in AACR2R be reworked to be more in conformity with the definition of ‘expression’ in FRBR (See [Appendix C](#)).

**Proposed text for rule 0.24 to support option 5 to deal with format variations:**

1. Create a new record for each different edition/expression of a monographic work.
Consider that a new edition/expression is involved whenever
  
a) There is any change in statement of responsibility or credits
     (new statements of subsidiary authorship)
  b) There is any change in edition statement that indicates a
     substantive change in the underlying edition/expression
  c) There is any change in extent
  d) There is addition of illustrations, maps, bibliographies or other
     supplementary material not present in other edition/expressions
  e) There is an explicit indication of changes (including corrections)
     of content; includes changes in contents notes
  f) There is any change in language of the work

Changes in the marks of identification that are important enough to
  treat as a change in edition/expression (‘title-expression?’ ‘title-
  edition?’) even if there is no change in the underlying
  edition/expression:
  a) Change in title or subtitle
  b) Change in series
  c) Change in the form of the statement of responsibility or credits?

Do not create a new record if the only variation is in one or more of the
following areas:

Note: If any of these changes occur in conjunction with changes listed
above, they should be noted in the new bibliographic record that
results. However, if they occur in isolation, not associated with any
change in the underlying edition/expression, they should not cause the
creation of a new record.
  a) Change in edition statement, not associated with change in
     edition/expression; e.g. absence or presence of “book club edition,”
     “first edition,” or “paperback edition” statements
  b) Change in place of publication, as long as the change is not
     associated with change in edition/expression
  c) Change in publisher or distributor, as long as the change is not
     associated with change in edition/expression
  d) Change in publication date, printing date or copyright date, as
     long as the change is not associated with change in edition/expression
  e) Minor variation in series (see 21.2A1 and 21.2C?)
  f) Change in manifestation or carrier, e.g. change from
     audiocassette to CD, or from text to microform, or from text to
     digitized text, or from col. To b&w, as long as the change is not
     associated with change in edition/expression
g) Addition, deletion or change of an ISBN, as long as the change is not associated with change in edition/expression

h) Difference in paper, typography or binding, as long as the change is not associated with change in edition/expression

i) Difference in presence or absence of closed captioning

j) Addition or deletion of advertising matter

2. Create a new record for each incarnation of a serial work.

Consider that a new incarnation is involved whenever

a) The title changes

b) The corporate main entry changes

c) The corporate body used as a qualifier in the uniform title changes

d) The serial work is translated or issued in a language edition/expression

e) The serial’s enumeration repeats the exact numeric designation and the publisher does not link the old and new systems with a designation such as “new series” or “second series”

f) There is change in geographic coverage

Do not create a new record if the only variation is one or more of the following:

Note: If any of these changes occur in conjunction with changes listed above, they should be noted in the new bibliographic record that results. However, if they occur in isolation, not associated with any change in the underlying incarnation, they should not cause the creation of a new record.

a) Minor title variations among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work, including variation in order of titles in different languages, variation in titles other than the title proper, etc.

b) Minor variations in responsible entities among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work

c) Change of frequency among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work

d) Change in place of publication among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work

e) Change in publisher or distributor among issues or parts of an incarnation of a serial work

f) Change in manifestation or carrier, e.g. change from audiocassette to CD, or from text to microform, or from text to digitized text, or from col. To b&w
g) Difference in paper, typography or binding
h) Difference in presence or absence of closed captioning

3. All changes to an integrating work should be described on one latest-entry record.

**Pro's:** Option 5 would meet Goal 3, clarity for both the public and for cataloguers about what the object of a bibliographic record is, or about what a record represents (i.e., whether it represents a particular edition/expression or a particular manifestation). Separate records would be made for different edition/expressions of the same work, but the same record would be used for different manifestations of the same edition/expression of the same work.

Option 5 would meet Goal 9 in that it would clearly express to the public the situation in which two items represent the same edition/expression of the same work and differ only in carrier.

Option 5 would codify the practice that is actually being followed in many libraries for preservation microfilming and digitization projects. These practices are likely to become more and more widespread with the development of digital library initiatives. In addition, Option 5 would allow the same treatment for items created by the simultaneous release of various kinds of content in both analog and digital formats, which is becoming more and more common, and which prevents designation of an original.

**Con's:** Option 5 would involve costs, as well as dysjunctions between older and newer records.

Option 5 would require cataloguer’s judgment. There would be times when Goal 2, clarity for cataloguers in determining when two similar items should be described on two different bibliographic records, might not be met, although research should be done to determine how frequently that might occur. One suspects it would not occur often.

It might be more difficult to meet Goal 8, in that, depending on the underlying record structure, Option 5, might make the production of exchangable records more complex.
8. Change to Section Heading ‘Methods of Procedure’

The Task Force recommends that the current heading for the section that contains rule 0.24 in AACR2R (on p. 8) be changed to the following:

USING PART I

Our reasons are two. First, the newly reworded header serves to establish a framework for the conditions/mindset/frame of reference under which the cataloguer must labor in accomplishing the building of a record according to part I. Secondly, it also serves the function of avoiding a micro-managing road map style of instruction, and so avoids the implication that a cataloguer must start in place X on the cataloguing record and move to place Y, an implication which is present in the current header and subsequent text.

9. GMD’S — A Special Problem

In creating cataloguing examples of items with multiple characteristics (in section IV.4 above) and in carrying out experiments in reorganization based on ISBD area, it quickly became apparent that one of the most intractable content-carrier problems in AACR2R is presented by the GMD. This is a problem that is not going to go away under any of the proposed options, and probably needs to be addressed independently as a problem in its own right.

The underlying problem is that the GMD’s are as riddled with content and carrier contradiction as the descriptive chapters of AACR2R (and the ISBDs from which they derive, for that matter). What should the GMD be for a digital map or motion picture? A map or music manuscript? If an option for dealing with format variation that allows a single record approach is adopted, what should be done about the case in which a GMD applies to one item attached to the record, but not to the other, e.g. a record that represents both a textual serial and an electronic serial?

Possible options for dealing with the GMD problem include:

1. Provide a table of precedence to support the current approach requiring choice of a single GMD from the current list.
2. Allow the formulation of a compound GMD when required:
   a. allow the addition of the terms ‘electronic’ or ‘manuscript’ to existing GMD’s when applicable, e.g. ‘electronic game’;
   b. allow the addition of terms such as ‘electronic’ or ‘manuscript’ as a parenthetical qualifier, e.g. ‘game (electronic)’;
   c. allow the assignment of more than one GMD separated by the ‘+’ symbol, e.g. ‘game + electronic resource’;
   d. allow the addition of terms such as ‘electronic’ or ‘manuscript’ in inverted form, e.g. ‘game, electronic’.

   Any of these approaches would require an explicit rule in or following 1.1C2.

3. Abandon the use of the GMD. This would require deletion of rule 1.1C and its counterparts in other chapters. (NOTE: Currently, GMD’s are required by ISBD, so if AACR2R abandoned the GMD, it would be failing to follow ISBD in this regard.) Task Force members agree that this option should not be adopted without first studying the impact on existing libraries and systems. If MARC coding is used differently by different systems to produce OPAC displays as a substitute for the GMD, there might be an undesirable loss of consistency across systems.

4. If the GMD is abandoned, consider transferring the “early warning” function of the GMD to Area 3, allowing whatever combinations of terms are necessary to signal to users that the record they are looking at is “not a book,” and/or “requires special equipment.”

5. Continue to use the single GMD as is in AACR2R, but allow use in Area 3 of whatever combinations of GMD terms are necessary to bring out aspects of the item not covered by the single GMD chosen.

Like the transcription problem, the GMD problem is probably too large to be tackled by this Task Force, and should be left for others to solve.
10. Introductory Chapter

The Task Force recommends that JSC add an introductory chapter (variously described as ‘a conceptual chapter,’ ‘a statement of principles,’ and ‘an expanded introduction to either the descriptive section of the code or the whole code’) to address the following topics:

- The principles of AACR2 as determined by the Joint Steering Committee
- The issue of edition/expression. This should include a discussion of what can be an edition/expression of what. Can moving image material ever constitute an edition/expression of a musical or textual work? This should also include a discussion of the principles underlying rules concerning when to make a new record.
- Format variation and variation in distribution information (the issue of manifestation)
- Seriality
- Integrating items
- Electronic resources available remotely, including their physicality and virtuality
- Transcription
- The use of cataloguers’ judgement
- Items with multiple characteristics
- Mixed materials (e.g. kits, interactive multimedia, and the issue of predominant content, e.g. how do you determine whether the item is a) text with illustrations, b) illustrations with text, or c) a mixed work consisting of both textual and graphic content?)

It was the consensus of the Task Force that it would be inappropriate for us to attempt to draft such a chapter, as many of the topics that should be covered are out of scope for our charge, which was to deal specifically with rule 0.24 (which governs treatment of items with multiple characteristics, and treatment of format variation between two items that contain the same edition/expression of the same work). However, the Subgroup assigned to draft 0.24 language to support option 1 for dealing with multiple characteristics included a great deal of language in their report that might appropriately be placed in such an introductory chapter (See Appendix A).
Appendix A:
Report From The Subgroup On
Option 1 For Multiple Characteristics

Note from Chair: This document was submitted by Laurel Jizba on behalf of the subgroup on Option 1 for multiple characteristics, for inclusion in the first draft of the overall report that was reviewed by the entire Task Force during the month of May, 1999. During the month-long review, the proposed text for option 1 was revised considerably, as reflected in the section of the report proper that deals with Option 1. Appendix A may now be of historical interest only.

COMBINED REVISED TEXTS for 0.24 Versions A, B-C and D

I. PROPOSED NEW SECTION HEADING (p. 8)

Change: METHODS OF PROCEDURE to USING PART I

Justification for Changing the Heading. Replacing “Methods of procedure” with “Using part I” serves two functions. First, the newly reworded header serves to establish a framework for the conditions/ mindset/ frame of reference under which the cataloger must labor in accomplishing the building of a record according to part I. Second, it serves the function of avoiding a micro-managing road map style of instruction, avoiding the implication that a cataloger must start in place X on the cataloging record and move to place Y, an implication which is present in the current header and subsequent text.

Rejected heading options. Other section heading options considered but for which there was less preference were: Option a. Change: “Methods of procedure” to “Use of part I” Option b. Change: “Methods of procedure” to “Framework for working in part I.” Alternatively, eliminating the “Methods of procedure” header altogether, leaving the 0.24 and 0.25 texts to fall under the previous header, which would then be revised to read as follows in either options c. or d. Option c. Change: “Structure of part I” to “Structure and use of part I”. Option d. Change: “Structure of part I” to “Structure and framework for working in part I”. 
II. PROPOSED REVISED TEXTS for 0.24

A. TEXT VERSION A.

0.24 Taken together, chapters 2-13 of part I collectively represent classes of materials. It is a central principle of the use of part I that description should be primarily based on only one of the chapters in part I, and so primarily based on only one of class of material.

For both monographs and serials, consider the physical item first, not the original or previous formats in which the work may exist. If a bibliographic item is not available directly, but is remotely accessed on a computer, base the description on the observed or otherwise known characteristics of the item. (Cf. Chapter 9).

Also consult those chapters relevant to other characteristics of the item, chapters which would enable fuller description and enhance accurate identification. This relates to use of those chapters dealing with the original, previous or concomitant formats, as applicable. For example, consult chapters 5 and 6 in constructing notes on musical edition and history and/or names of composers or performers relating to description of the whole of a musical computer file, if such notes are considered important for primary identification of the electronic resource (e.g., an electronic resource which includes textual analysis, commentary and biography, performances of selections of several composers' works and related scores).

In describing serials, consult both chapter 12 and the chapter or chapters relevant to various aspects of the serial. For example, in describing a serial cartographic computer file, give details relating first to the computer file, then to the cartographic material, and finally to the seriality, in that order.

B-C. TEXT VERSION B-C.

0.24 Taken together, chapters 2-11 of part I collectively represent classes of materials. A class of materials constitutes any of several bibliographic groups having similar characteristics that differentiate one group of materials from another. These characteristics require members of these groups to be catalogued with attention to their unique shared characteristics. The major categories are: textual materials (books, pamphlets and printed sheets and the texts of serials); cartographic materials; manuscripts; music; sound recordings; motion pictures and video recordings; graphic materials; original electronic resources; 3-D artifacts and realia; and original microforms.
In using part I, consider that accurate transcription and description are key to the best practice of bibliographic description. Transcription is the act of copying data from the chief source of a bibliographic item, for identification, to supply areas of description. See rule 1.0E for details on the mechanics of transcription. Chapters emphasizing transcription from one chief source are chapters 2-9, and 11. Description, a broader concept than transcription, includes transcription, identification through further examination of the item, and the addition of other required or useful information known about the item, all of which assist in creating standard areas of description. All chapters require some aspect of both transcription and observational description. Chapters 10 and 12 place more emphasis on observational description than on transcription, the former as there is often no chief source and the latter as chief source information is widely scattered or otherwise supplied by the publisher. {CAVEAT: There was dissent on the Task Force for including this section. Some wanted more study of the issue. However, at least three Task Force members support it, as a theoretical truth to be explained in 0.24. Further, it is under consideration for AACR2R by Conser. Conser proposals consulted. The reference made to the latter sources is general; no specific proposed wording in the above proposed revision of rule 0.24 is directly attributable to those sources.}

A bibliographic item is a manifestation of a work that forms the basis for a bibliographic description. A bibliographic item may be perceived directly through touch, sight or sound, or only indirectly through observation, as in the case of remote electronic resources.

For mixed materials and material with multiple characteristics, consult those chapters relevant to other characteristics of the item, chapters that would enable fuller description and enhance accurate identification. This relates to use of chapters dealing with the original, previous or concomitant formats, as applicable. For example, consult chapters 5 and 6 in constructing notes on musical edition and history and/or names of composers or performers relating to description of the whole of a musical electronic resource, if such notes are considered important for primary identification of the electronic resource (e.g., an electronic resource which includes textual analysis, commentary and biography, performances of selections of several composers’ works and related scores). {Reference could be made to an expanded 1.10 for instructions for choosing among general material designations, use of an expanded area 3 (for all chapters), and summary note construction, etc. Or say, a new chapter (15?) if preferred over 1 for mixed materials.}
It is a central principle of the use of part I that description should be based first on one of three forms of issuance: monograph, serial, integrating entity, and subsequently on various other chapters in part I that are applicable to the bibliographic item being described, depending upon the policies of an individual bibliographic agency.

In considering form of issuance, determine whether the item is best treated as a monograph, as a serial, or as an integrating entity. Consider the following, and then consult the appropriate chapter of Part I, as indicated.

**Monograph.** A monograph is a bibliographic item complete in one part or complete or intended to be completed in a finite number of separate parts within a fixed period of time (e.g., printed books, manuscripts, music scores, motion pictures and videorecordings, 3-D artifacts and realia, electronic resources such as CD-ROMs, electronic disks, some Web sites, etc.). Description is primarily from transcription. Choose the chapter (class of materials) most applicable in describing the physical item and in determining the chief source. As applicable, also consult one or more of the chapters 2-11, when describing characteristics highlighted in those chapters, characteristics beyond those discussed in the primary chapter for the physical item. Consult also chapter 1 for mixed materials and materials with multiple characteristics. [Or, a new chapter if a new chapter is preferred over an expanded chapter l for mixed materials.]

**Serial.** A serial is a bibliographic item issued in successive parts usually bearing numeric or chronological designations and ongoing, so intended to be continued indefinitely with no predetermined conclusion, and in any medium, including print, microform and direct and remote electronic resources. Serials include journals, magazines, annuals, some conference proceedings, newspapers, monographic series. Consult chapter 12 for chief source information and instructions for recording the identifying and enduring characteristics of the serial, including important changes to the title, issuing body, numbering sequences, etc. Subsequently, as applicable, also consult one or more of 2-11 when describing characteristics highlighted in those chapters, characteristics beyond those discussed in chapter 12. Consult also chapter 1 for mixed materials and materials with multiple characteristics. For example, in describing a serial cartographic electronic resource, give details relating first to the serial and then to both the electronic and cartographic aspects of the resource. [NOTE: Conser proposals, Serials Review v.24:3/4 consulted]

**Integrating entity.** An integrating entity is a bibliographic item issued with the potential for seamless integration of new data into the content (e.g., looseleaf services, online databases and some Web sites). As applicable, also consult one or more of chapters 2-11 when describing characteristics highlighted in those chapters. * Note that monographs and
serials accompanied by materials issued in differing forms from the material they accompany are not to be considered integrating entities and treated either as monographs or serials. Equally, monographs and other bibliographic items issued in discrete physical parts (e.g., serials, electronic resources such as CD-ROMs, electronic disks, etc.) are not to be considered integrating entities. {*For integrating entities, in the future consult a new chapter (14?). Conser proposals, Serials Review v.24:3/4 consulted}

D. TEXT VERSION D. Text version D would include everything found in text version B-C. However, the following text would be added:

An edition is considered to consist of all copies produced from substantially the same master copy for all bibliographic items. Not to be considered a new edition are minor changes to the content of the item or changes to the formatting, such as corrections of misspellings of data, changes in the arrangement of the contents, most changes in the type and size of physical carrier, and for electronic resources, changes in system-related format, differences in display or output formats, technical differences relating to character code, blocking or density. See chapters 2-l2 for details.

Adherence to the principles espoused in the Anglo-American Cataloguing Rules is critical for exchange of records in shared cataloguing databases. See Part III of AACR for a discussion of AACR in the context of shared bibliographic databases.

For multiple version records in shared databases, consider that in certain specific circumstances, given the policies of an individual bibliographic agency and of the databases, in the case that there are minor variations in physical format or distribution details, such as between films and videorecordings or between print and microform reproductions, record those variations on the same record for the original, starting with the description of the original. Part III of AACR must be consulted. Alternatively, depending upon the policies of a bibliographic agency, it may be possible for a bibliographic agency to record those minor variations in subrecords attached to the record representing the particular edition of the particular work represented by an item. Consult part III for details, including discussions of subrecords.
III. JUSTIFICATIONS FOR REVISED TEXTS for 0.24 (A, B-C and D below refer to the texts above).

A. MODERATE CHANGE. (A) Functionally, the above revised text A of 0.24 holds the assumption that Chapter 9 is the way it is now. No new additional chapter at the front of part I or of the whole of AACR2R is assumed. However, remote objects are brought into the same realm as physical objects by use of the adjective “observed” and instructions for multiple characteristics are made relatively more clearly than before.

B. FRAMEWORK and LANGUAGE. (A, B-C, D) Like the revised header proposal, the three text versions function to establish the framework for the conditions/ mindset/ frame of reference under which the cataloger must labor in accomplishing the building of a record according to part I. The language and phrasing are modernized, the tone of voice is improved. The dated and obfuscatory term “cardinal principle” is changed to the clearer and more modern “central principle” and “in the first instance” is changed to “primarily”. Remote objects are brought into the same realm as physical objects by use of the adjective “observed” to describes what the cataloger sees when the item is a computer, as opposed to being located “in hand”. Instructions for items with multiple characteristics are made more clearly.

C. NO ROADMAP/ PROCEDURE. (A, B-C, D) Like the new header, the revised text also serves the function of avoiding a micro-managing road map/ procedure unlike the present header and text. Unambiguously, the cataloger may develop an individual work flow.

D. GUIDANCE/ INSTRUCTION INCREASED. (A, B-C, D) More fleshed-out guidance is provided than in the existing 0.24. The texts read and flow better, so the messages about underlying functions are less obscured, and the examples are improved.

E. ISBD(ER) HARMONIZATION WITH CHAPTER 9. (B-C, D) These two versions (B-C, D) assume that the ISBD(ER) has been incorporated into chapter 9 of part I of AACR2R, that Chapter 9 is using the term “electronic resource” , and that other portions of AACR2R have been harmonized as well.

F. MULTIPLE/ MIXED CHARACTERISTICS. (B-C, D) The language used functions to: a) give importance to highlighting various characteristics of an item; b) indicate positive aspects that other chapters can bring to the basic chapter using the adjectives “fuller” and “enhance”; c) bring in “original or previous formats”, per the current text; d) indicate parallel
occurrence of further characteristics based in other formats by adding “concomitant formats”; e) update the discussion with a new example that clearly falls into a mixed category for which additional instruction in the rules has been needed; and f) eliminates the controversial chapter 11 example. It does not provide a table of precedence for materials.

G. THREE FORMS OF ISSUANCE. (B-C, D) The cataloguer is asked to focus on determining which of three forms of issuance apply to an item, then subsequently to focus on further characteristics.

H. OVERALL THEORY. (B-C, D) Philosophical instruction in a myriad of overarching situations are addressed in these texts, including: a) defining classes of materials and b) bibliographic item to include remote resources; c) multiple characteristics; d) transcription and the related importance of description in the context of serials and realia (three dimensional objects, found objects, clothing, etc.); e) integrating entities, including aspects of looseleaf printed monographs and content-changed remote resources; f) current issues of seriality (three forms of issuance).

I. ISBD(ER) EDITION. Version D functions to extend to all materials the ISBD(ER) approach of ignoring minor physical variations when considering edition.

J. STANDARDS IN DATABASES and MULVER. Version D calls for creating a new Part III of AACR, including: a) statements about the critical function that standardized description plays in creating records in shared databases and b) the concept of multiple versions only in the context of such databases. It might be entitled: “The Anglo-American Cataloguing Rules in Shared Databases and Bibliographic Description of Reproductions and Editions on Single Records”.


L. OMISSIONS FROM A. Version A does not incorporate the ISBD(ER) language. It lacks adequate discussion and instruction in a myriad of overarching situations not addressed elsewhere in AACR2R. Class of materials is not defined. Further, no functional statements are present to cover: a) multiple characteristics, in more depth; b) outright statements about transcription or the related importance of description and intent of publisher in the context of serials, archival materials, realia, etc.; d) integrating aspects of looseleaf printed monographs and remote resources to which content is added or changed.
M. OMISSIONS FROM A AND B-C. Versions A and B-C do not include functional statements to cover: a) editions; b) generalized statements about the critical function that standardized description plays in creating records in shared databases; c) furthermore, this version does not address multiple version issues (which, as discussed in our January 1999 Task Force report, may be related not only to description per se, but also to database record exchange).

N. NO OMISSIONS EXIST FOR Version D.

IV. UNDERLYING ASSUMPTIONS.

A. PRESENT ASSUMED. Version A can work in the present, with the current Chapter 9.

B. PRESENT OR FUTURE ASSUMED. Version B-C can work in the present or in the future. If in the future, the ISBD(ER) has been incorporated and some portions of AACR2R part I have been extended or enhanced, as discussed.

C. FUTURE ASSUMED. In the future, a new chapter (for example a chapter 14), could be added for integrating entities, heavily adapted from Hallam’s work and expanded to include not only print looseleafs but also electronic integrating resources and in other applicable formats.

D. FUTURE ASSUMED. In the future, chapter 1 could be expanded to better address mixed materials and materials with multiple characteristics, since 1.10 “Items made up of several types of material” already exists and could be a) expanded with tables of precedence for mixed characteristics, or alternatively with b) statements such as “choose to highlight characteristics depending upon the policies of an individual bibliographic agency”. Located here may be a discussion of the most appropriate choices for GMD. Area 3 could also be expanded to other chapters in the future and be made repeatable. More standard guidance on summary notes could be added. Alternatively, instead of expanding chapter 1, a new chapter 15 might be created for mixed materials.
Appendix B: Reorganization of Area 1

By Martha Yee

The following represents an attempt to demonstrate what a reorganization of AACR2R by ISBD areas might look like. The approach taken was simply to bring together all of the rules concerning Area 1, eliminating duplication, but without any further editing of the rules themselves.

Conventions of this exercise:

Variations from Chapter 1 are noted. When the identical text is present in a later chapter, this is not noted. When the Chapter 1 text is missing, this is noted in brackets and bold face. When a variant on the Chapter 1 text is present, this is noted in brackets and bold face.

Variation is noted paragraph by paragraph.

A statement such as ‘Transcribe the title proper as instructed in 1.1B’ is taken to mean that there is no variation from 1.1B, and this is not noted below.

1.1. TITLE AND STATEMENT OF RESPONSIBILITY AREA

Contents:
1.1A. Preliminary rule
1.1B. Title proper
1.1C. General material designation
1.1D. Parallel titles
1.1E. Other title information
1.1F. Statements of responsibility
1.1G. Items without a collective title [12 missing]

1.1A. Preliminary rule

1.1A1. Punctuation

For instructions on the use of spaces before and after prescribed punctuation, see 1.0C.
Precede the title of a supplement or section (see 1.1B9) by a full stop.
[4, 10 missing]
Enclose the general material designation in square brackets.
Precede each parallel title by an equals sign.
Precede each unit of other title information by a colon.
Precede the first statement of responsibility by a diagonal slash. Precede each subsequent statement of responsibility by a semicolon. For the punctuation of this area for items without a collective title, see 1.1G3. [12 missing]

[2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11 variant: For the punctuation of this area for items without a collective title, see 1.1G.]

For the use of the equals sign to precede parallel statements, see the appropriate rules following. [2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12 missing]

1.1A2. Sources of information. Take information recorded in this area from the chief source of information for the material to which the item being described belongs. Enclose information supplied from any other source in square brackets. [2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12 missing]

Give the elements of data in the order of the sequence of the following rules, even if this means transposing data. Transcribe the data as found, however, if case endings are affected, if the grammatical construction of the data would be disturbed, or if one element is inseparably linked to another. [2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12 missing]

1.1B. Title proper

1.1B1. Transcribe the title proper exactly as to wording, order, and spelling, but not necessarily as to punctuation and capitalization. Give accentuation and other diacritical marks that are present in the chief source of information (see also 1.0G). Capitalize according to appendix A.

An alternative title is part of the title proper (see Glossary, appendix D). Precede and follow the word or (or its equivalent in another language) introducing an alternative title by a comma. Capitalize the first word of the alternative title.

If the title proper as given in the chief source of information includes the punctuation marks … or [ ], replace them by __ and ( ), respectively.

If the title proper as given in the chief source of information includes symbols that cannot be reproduced by the facilities available, replace them with a cataloguer’s description in square brackets. Make an explanatory note if necessary.
[2.12-18 variant: 2.14E. Transcription of certain letters]

2.14E1. Transcribe capitals that are to be converted to lowercase according to the usage of the text. If the usage of the text is in doubt or if it is inconsistent, transcribe

- I as i
- J as i
- U as u (but as v when it is the first letter of the word)
- V as u (but as v when it is the first letter of the word)
- VV as uu (but as vv when it is the first letter of the word)

Transcribe gothic capitals in the form of J and U as I and V.]

[3 variant: 3.1B2. If the title proper includes a statement of the scale, include that statement in the transcription.]

[5 variant: 5.1B1. Transcribe the title proper as instructed in 1.1B. If a title consists of the name(s) of one or more type(s) of composition, or one or more type(s) of composition and one or more of the following:

- medium of performance
- key
- date of composition
- number

treat type of composition, medium of performance, etc., as the title proper.

In all other cases, if one or more statements of medium of performance, key, date of composition, and/or number are found in the source of information, treat those elements as other title information (see 5.1E).

In case of doubt, treat statements of medium of performance, key, date of composition, and number as part of the title proper.]

[6 variant: 6.1B1. Transcribe the title proper as instructed in 1.1B. For data to be included in titles proper for musical items, see 5.1B.]

[9 variant: 9.1B3. Do not record a file name or a data set name as the title proper unless it is the only name given in the chief source. If desired, give a file name or data set name not used as the title proper in a note (see 9.7B4).]

[12 variant: 12.1B2. When the title appears in full and in the form of an acronym or initialism in the chief source of information, choose the full form as the title proper unless the acronym or initialism is the only form of title presented in other locations in the serial.]
12.1B7. If the title includes a date or numbering that varies from issue to issue, omit this date or numbering and replace it by the mark of omission, unless it occurs at the beginning of the title, in which case do not give the mark of omission.

If the title proper is not taken from the chief source of information, give the source of the title in a note (see 1.7B3).

[6 variant: If the title proper is not taken from the chief source of information or if it is taken from a container that is a unifying element, give the source of the title in a note (see 6.7B3).]

[8 variant: If the title proper is taken from a container that is a unifying element, or if it is not taken from the chief source of information, give the source of the title in a note (see 8.7B3).]

[9 variant: 9.1B2. Always give the source of the title proper in a note (see 9.7B3). If the title has been supplied (see 1.1B7), give the source of the supplied title in a note (see 9.7B3).]

[11 variant: If the title proper is not taken from the chief source of information or if the chief source of information is a container or eye-readable matter, give the source of the title in a note (see 11.7B3).]

[12 variant: If the title proper is not taken from the chief source of information or if, in a printed serial, it is taken from a title page substitute (see 12.0B1), give the source in a note (see 12.7B3).]

1.1B2. If the title proper includes a statement of responsibility or the name of a publisher, distributor, etc., and the statement or name is an integral part of the title proper (i.e., connected by a case ending or other grammatical construction), transcribe it as part of the title proper.

[12 variant: 12.1B3. In case of doubt about whether a corporate body’s name or an abbreviation of that name is part of the title proper, treat the name as such only if it is consistently so presented in various locations in the serial (cover, caption, masthead, editorial pages, etc.) and/or, when cataloguing retrospectively, in indexes, abstracts, or other lists.]

1.1B3. If the title proper consists solely of the name of a person or body responsible for the item, transcribe such a name as the title proper.

1.1B4. Abridge a long title proper only if this can be done without loss of essential information. Never omit any of the first five words of the title proper (excluding the alternative title). Indicate omissions by the mark of omission.
[2.12-18 variant: 2.14B. In abridging a long title proper (see 1.1B4), omit first any alternative title and the connecting word (e.g., or), then omit inessential words or groups of words. Indicate omissions by the mark of omission.]

1.1B5. If a letter or word appears only once but the design of the chief source of information makes it clear that it is intended to be read more than once, repeat the letter or word without the use of square brackets.

If the first level of description is used (see 1.0D1), the transcription of such a title is:

1.1B6. If a title proper includes separate letters or initials without full stops between them, transcribe such letters without spaces between them.

If such letters or initials have full stops between them, transcribe them with full stops and omit any internal spaces.

1.1B7. Supply a title proper for an item lacking a chief source of information from the rest of the item, or a reference source, or elsewhere. If no title can be found in any source, devise a brief descriptive title. Enclose such a supplied or devised title in square brackets.

[2.12-18 variant: 2.14A. If the item has no title page and if no other source furnishes a title proper, transcribe as the title proper as many of the opening words of the text as are sufficient to identify the item uniquely.]

[3 variant: 3.1B4. If the item lacks a title, supply one as instructed in 1.1B7. Always include in the supplied title the name of the area covered.]

[4 variant: 4.1B2. If a manuscript or manuscript collection lacks a title, supply one as instructed below. Give the source of a supplied title (other than one composed by the cataloguer) in the note area (see 4.7B3).

Manuscript volumes and similar material. Supply a brief title indicating the nature of the material for literary manuscripts, diaries, journals, memorandum books, account books, etc. For manuscripts of subsequently published texts, give the title by which the work is known.

Ancient, medieval and Renaissance manuscripts and oriental manuscripts lacking a title page. [f.n.] Follow, when appropriate, the provisions for early printed monographs (see 2.14). If those rules do not apply, supply a title by which the work is known or a title indicating the nature of the material.
Single letters, postcards, telegrams, radiograms, etc. Supply a title consisting of Letter (or Postcard, Telegram, etc.), the date of writing (expressed as year, month, day), the place of writing, the name of the addressee, and place to which addressed. Enclose any details not taken from the letter, etc., its envelope, or enclosures, in square brackets.

Speeches, sermons, etc. Supply a title consisting of an appropriate word (e.g. Speech, Address) followed by the place and/or the occasion of the delivery.

Legal documents (wills, deeds, mortgages, leases, warrants, commissions, etc.) Supply a title consisting of a word or brief phrase characterizing the document, the date of signing (expressed as year, month, day), the name(s) of persons concerned other than those responsible for the document, and the occasion for the document if it can be expressed concisely. Enclose any details not taken from the document in square brackets.

Collections of manuscript materials formed by or around a person, family, corporate body, or subject. The materials may be in their original form or reproductions, and may include photographs and printed materials. Give the title by which the collection is known, or supply a title indicating the nature of the collection. Unless more specific terms are used, use Letters for letters by an individual, Correspondence for letters between persons or to a person or persons, Papers for miscellaneous personal or family material, and Records for materials relating to a corporate body.

Miscellaneous single manuscripts. For a manuscript not covered by the above sections, give the title by which it is known, or supply a title indicating the nature of the material.[

[5 variant: 5.1B2. In a supplied title proper (see 1.1B7), give all of the elements prescribed for uniform titles for music in the order prescribed in 25.25-25.35.]

[7 variant: 7.1B2. If an item lacks a title, supply one as instructed in 1.1B7 and also follow these particular instructions.

Commercials. Supply for a short advertising film a title consisting of the name of the product, service, etc., advertised, and the word advertisement.
Unedited material and newsfilm. Include in a supplied title for unedited material, stock shots, and newsfilm all the major elements present in the picture in order of their occurrence (e.g., place, date of event, date of shooting (if different), personalities, and subjects).

 Optionally, give a description of the action and length of each shot in a note (see 7.7B18).

[8 variant: 8.1B2. If a single graphic item lacks a title, supply one as instructed in 1.1B7.

8.1B3. If a collection of graphic items lacks a title, supply a title by which the collection is known or a title indicating the nature of the collection.]

1.1B8. If the chief source of information bears titles in two or more languages or scripts, transcribe as the title proper the one in the language or script of the main written, spoken, or sung content of the item. If this criterion is not applicable, choose the title proper by reference to the order of titles on, or the layout of, the chief source of information. Record the other titles as parallel titles (see 1.1D).

[3 variant: 3.1B3. If the chief source of information bears more than one title, choose the title proper as instructed in 1.1B8. If both or all of the titles are in the same language and script, choose the title proper on the basis of the sequence or layout of the titles. If these are insufficient to enable the choice to be made or are ambiguous, choose the most comprehensive title.]

1.1B9. If the title proper for an item that is supplementary to, or a section of, another item appears in two or more parts not grammatically linked, give the title of the main work first, followed by the title(s) of the supplementary item(s) or section(s) in order of their dependence. Separate the parts of the title proper by full stops.

[12 variant: 12.1B4. If a serial is a separately published section of, or supplement to, another serial and its title proper as presented in the chief source of information consists of

a) the title common to all sections (or the title of the main serial) and
b) the title of the section or supplement

and if these two parts are grammatically independent of each other, give the common title followed by the section or supplement title preceded by a full stop. In such a case disregard the order in which the parts of the title proper are presented in the chief source of information.
12.1B5. If the title of such a section or supplement (see 12.1B4) is preceded by an enumeration or alphabetic designation, give the common title, followed by the designation preceded by a full stop, and the section or supplement title preceded by a comma.

For enumeration used as a chronological series designation, see 12.3G.

12.1B6. If the title of a section or supplement is presented in the chief source of information without the title that is common to all sections, give the title of the section or supplement as the title proper. In the case of a section, give the title that is common to all sections as the title proper of the series (see 12.6B). In the case of a supplement, give the title of the main serial in a note (see 12.7B7).]

1.1B10. If the chief source of information bears both a collective title and the titles of individual works, give the collective title as the title proper and give the titles of the individual works in a contents note (see 1.7B18).

[12 variant: 12.1B8. If the title proper of a serial changes, make a new description (see 21.2C).]

1.1C. Optional addition. General material designation

1.1C1. Choose one of the lists of general material designations given below and use terms from the chosen list in all descriptions for which general material designations are desired. [f.n.]

If general material designations are to be used in cataloguing, British agencies should use terms from list 1 and agencies in Australia, Canada, and the United States should use terms from list 2. [f.n.]

[list]

For materials for the visually impaired, add (large print) or (tactile), when appropriate, to any term in list 2. Add (braille), when appropriate, to any term in list 2 other than braille or text.

1.1C2. If an item consists of material falling within one category in the list chosen, give the appropriate designation immediately following the title proper (or the last part of the title proper, see 1.1B9).

In the case of an item having no collective title, give the appropriate designation immediately following the first title (inclusive of part titles (see 1.1B9) and alternative titles (see 1.1B1), but exclusive of parallel titles (see 1.1D) and other title information (see 1.1E)).
1.1C3. If the item is a reproduction in one material of a work originally presented in another material (e.g., a text as microform; a map on a slide), give the general material designation appropriate to the material being described (e.g., in the case of a map on a slide, give the designation appropriate to the slide).

1.1C4. If an item contains parts belonging to materials falling into two or more categories in the list chosen and if none of these is the predominant constituent of the item, give multimedia or kit (see 1.1C1 and 1.10C1).

[7 variant: 7.1C2. [as above, then:] Treat a sound track (recorded sound physically integrated or synchronized with the item and intended to be played with it) as an integral part of the motion picture or videorecording, and give the general material designation appropriate to the motion picture or videorecording alone. See also 7.5C3 and 7.7B10a.]

1.1D. Parallel titles

1.1D1. Transcribe parallel titles in the order indicated by their sequence on, or by the layout of, the chief source of information.

1.1D2. In preparing a second-level description (see 1.0D2), give the first parallel title. Give any subsequent parallel title that is in English.

   If, in preparing a second-level description, all of the following conditions apply:
   a) the title proper is in a nonroman script
   b) the first parallel title recorded in accordance with the instructions in the preceding paragraph is in a nonroman script
   c) no title is in English
   give as the second parallel title the one that is (in order of preference) in French, German, Spanish, Latin, any other roman alphabet language.

   In preparing a third-level description (see 1.0D3), transcribe all parallel titles appearing in the chief source of information according to the instructions in 1.1B.

1.1D3. Transcribe an original title in a language different from that of the title proper appearing in the chief source of information as a parallel title if the item contains all or some of the text in the original language, or if the original title appears before the title proper in the chief source of information. Transcribe as other title information an original title in the same language as the title proper (see 1.1E). In all other cases give the original title in a note.
7 variant: 7.1D2. Transcribe an original title in another language appearing in the chief source of information as a parallel title.]

1.1D4. Give parallel titles appearing outside the chief source of information in a note (see 1.7B5).

5 variant: 5.1D1. Transcribe parallel titles as instructed in 1.1D.

If the chief source includes statements of medium of performance, key, date of composition, and/or number that are treated as part of the title proper (see 5.1B1) in two or more languages or scripts, transcribe such information in the order in which it appears in the chief source of information. Precede each set of parallel statements by an equals sign.

12 variant: 12.1D2. If, in the case of a serial with a title proper made up of a title common to a number of sections and a section title, the common title has a parallel title and the section title has a parallel title, give the common title and the section title that make up the title proper followed by the parallel common title and the parallel section title (see 12.1B4).]

1.1E. Other title information

1.1E1. Transcribe all other title information appearing in the chief source of information according to the instructions in 1.1B.

1.1E2. Transcribe other title information in the order indicated by the sequence on, or the layout of, the chief source of information.

1.1E3. Lengthy other title information. If the other title information is lengthy, either give it in a note (see 1.7B5) or abridge it.

Abridge other title information only if this can be done without loss of essential information. Never omit any of the first five words of the other title information. Indicate omissions by the mark of omission.

2.12-18 variant: 2.14F. Abridge lengthy other title information and statements of responsibility by omitting inessential words or groups of words. Include as many words of a statement of responsibility as are necessary to identify the person(s) concerned.

1.1E4. If the other title information includes a statement of responsibility or the name of a publisher, distributor, etc., and the statement or name is an integral part of the other title information, transcribe it as such.

1.1E5. Transcribe other title information following the whole or part of the title proper or the parallel title to which it pertains.

If there are no parallel titles and if other title information appears in more than one language or script, give the other title information that is in the
language or script of the title proper. If this criterion does not apply, give the other title information that appears first. Optionally, give the other title information in other languages. Precede each parallel statement by an equals sign.

1.1E6. If the title proper needs explanation, supply a brief addition as other title information, in the language of the title proper.

[2.12-18 variant: 2.14D. Treat additions to the title, even if they are linked to it by a preposition, conjunction, prepositional phrase, etc., as other title information, not as part of the title proper.]

[3 variant: 3.1E2. If the title proper does not include an indication of the geographic area covered by the item and if the other title information does not include such an indication or if there is no other title information, supply, as other title information, a word or brief phrase indicating the area covered.]

[4 variant: 4.1E2. If a letter, etc., speech, sermon, etc., or legal document has a title lacking some information specified for supplied titles for those documents (see 4.1B2), add that information as other title information.]

[7 variant: 7.1E2. If the item is a trailer containing extracts from a larger film, add [trailer] as other title information.]

[12 variant: 12.1E1. Transcribe other title information as instructed in 1.1E.

When an acronym or initialism of the title and its full form appear in the chief source of information, treat the one not chosen as the title proper as the other title information.]

1.1F. Statements of responsibility

1.1F1. Transcribe statements of responsibility appearing prominently in the item in the form in which they appear there. If a statement of responsibility is taken from a source other than the chief source of information, enclose it in square brackets.

[4 variant: 4.1F1. Transcribe statements of responsibility relating to persons or bodies appearing on the manuscript as instructed in 1.1F.]

[6 variant: 6.1F1. Transcribe statements of responsibility relating to those persons or bodies credited with a major role in creating the intellectual content of the sound recording (e.g., as writers of spoken words, composers of performed music, collectors of field material, producers having artistic and/or intellectual responsibility) as instructed]
in 1.1F. If the participation of the person(s) or body (bodies) named in a statement found in the chief source of information goes beyond that of performance, execution, or interpretation of a work (as is commonly the case with “popular,” rock, and jazz music), give such a statement as a statement of responsibility. If, however, the participation is confined to performance, execution or interpretation (as is commonly the case with “serious” or classical music and recorded speech), give the statement in the note area (see 6.7B6).

6.1F2. If the members of a group, ensemble, company, etc., are named in the chief source of information as well as the name of the group, etc., give them in the note area (see 6.7B6) if they are considered important. Otherwise, omit them.]

[7 variant: 7.1F1. Transcribe statements of responsibility relating to those persons or bodies credited in the chief source of information with a major role in creating a film (e.g., as producer, director, animator) as instructed in 1.1F. Give all other statements of responsibility (including those relating to performance) in notes.

7.1F3. If a statement of responsibility names both the agency responsible for the production of a motion picture or videorecording and the agency for which it is produced, give the statement as found.]

[8 variant: 8.1F1. Transcribe statements of responsibility relating to persons or bodies credited with a major role in creating or participating in the creation or production of a graphic item (e.g., directors, producers, artists, designers, developers, sponsors) as instructed in 1.1F. Give all other statements of responsibility in notes.]

[9 variant: 9.1F1. Transcribe statements of responsibility relating to those persons or bodies credited with a major role in creating the content of the file as instructed in 1.1F.]

[10 variant: 10.1F1. Transcribe statements relating to persons or bodies responsible for the creation of the item, or for its display or selection, as instructed in 1.1F.]

[12 variant: 12.1F3. Do not record as statements of responsibility statements relating to persons that are editors of serials. If a statement relating to an editor is considered necessary by the cataloguing agency, give it in a note (see 12.7B6).]
1.1F2. If no statement of responsibility appears prominently in the item, neither construct one nor extract one from the content of the item. Give the relevant information in a note (see 1.7B6).

Do not include in the title and statement of responsibility area statements of responsibility that do not appear prominently in the item. If such a statement is necessary, give it in a note.

[4 variant: 4.1F2. Optional addition. If the name appended to, or the signature on, a manuscript is incomplete, complete the name.

4.1F3. If a manuscript lacks a signature or statement of responsibility, supply the name(s) of the person(s) responsible for it, if known.]

1.1F3. If a statement of responsibility precedes the title proper in the chief source of information, transpose it to its required position unless it is an integral part of the title proper (see 1.1A2 and 1.1B2).

1.1F4. Transcribe a single statement of responsibility as such whether the two or more persons or corporate bodies named in it perform the same function or different functions.

1.1F5. If a single statement of responsibility names more than three persons or corporate bodies performing the same function, or with the same degree of responsibility, omit all but the first of each group of such persons or bodies. Indicate the omission by the mark of omission (...) and add et al. (or its equivalent in a nonroman script) in square brackets.

1.1F6. If there is more than one statement of responsibility, transcribe them in the order indicated by their sequence on, or the layout of, the chief source of information. If the sequence and layout are ambiguous or insufficient to determine the order, transcribe the statements in the order that makes the most sense. If statements of responsibility appear in sources other than the chief source, transcribe them in the order that makes the most sense.

[12 variant: 12.1F4. In the case of a serial with a title proper made up of a title common to a number of sections and a section or supplement title, give a statement of responsibility after the part of the title proper to which it refers. In case of doubt, give the statements of responsibility at the end of the title proper.]
1.1F7. Include titles and abbreviations of titles of nobility, address, honour, and distinction, initials of societies, qualifications, date(s) of founding, mottoes, etc., in statements of responsibility if:

   a) such data are necessary grammatically
   b) the omission would leave only a person’s given name or surname
   c) the title is necessary to identify a person
   d) the title is a title of nobility, or is a British term of honour (Sir, Dame, Lord, or Lady)

Otherwise, omit all such data from statements of responsibility. Do not use the mark of omission.

[2.12-18 variant: 2.14C. Omit mottoes, quotations, dedications, statements, etc., appearing on the title page that are separate from the title proper.]

1.1F8. Add a word or short phrase to the statement of responsibility if the relationship between the title of the item and the person(s) or body (bodies) named in the statement is not clear.

1.1F9. Replace symbols or other matter that cannot be reproduced by the facilities available with the cataloguer’s description in square brackets. Make an explanatory note if necessary.

1.1F10. If an item has parallel titles but a statement(s) of responsibility in only one language or script, transcribe the statement of responsibility after all the parallel titles or other title information.

   If an item has parallel titles and a statement or statements of responsibility in more than one language or script, transcribe each statement after the title proper, parallel title, or other title information to which it relates.

   If it is not practicable to give the statements of responsibility after the titles to which they relate, transcribe the statement of responsibility in the language or script of the title proper and omit the others.

1.1F11. If there are no parallel titles and a statement of responsibility appears in more than one language or script, transcribe the statement in the language or script of the title proper. If this criterion does not apply, transcribe the statement that appears first.

1.1F12. Treat a noun phrase occurring in conjunction with a statement of responsibility as other title information if it is indicative of the nature of the work.
If the noun or noun phrase is indicative of the role of the person(s) or body (bodies) named in the statement of responsibility rather than of the nature of the work, treat it as part of the statement of responsibility.

In case of doubt, treat the noun or noun phrase as part of the statement of responsibility.

1.1F13. When a name associated with responsibility for the item is transcribed as part of the title proper (see 1.1B2) or other title information (see 1.1E4), do not make any further statement relating to that name unless such a statement is required for clarity, or unless a separate statement of responsibility including or consisting of that name appears in the chief source of information.

[12 variant: 12.1F2. If a statement of responsibility is transcribed, in full or in abbreviated form, as part of the title proper or other title information, do not give a further statement of responsibility unless such a statement appears separately in the chief source of information.]

1.1F14. Transcribe a statement of responsibility even if no person or body is named in that statement.

A statement of responsibility may include words or phrases that are neither names nor linking words.

1.1F15. Omit statements found in the chief source of information that neither constitute other title information nor form part of statements of responsibility.

1.1G. Items without a collective title [12 missing]

1.1G1. If, in an item lacking a collective title, one work is the predominant part, treat the title of that work as the title proper and name the other work(s) in a contents note (see 1.7B18). [12 missing]

[2 variant: If a printed monograph lacks a collective title, transcribe the titles of the individual parts as instructed in 1.1G.]

[3 variant: 3.1G1. If a cartographic item lacks a collective title, either describe the item as a unit (see 3.1G2 and 3.1G3), or make a separate description for each separately titled part (see 3.1G4), or (in certain circumstances) supply a collective title (see 3.1G5).]

[4 variant: If a single manuscript lacks a collective title, transcribe the titles of the individual parts as instructed in 1.1G.]
[5 variant: If an item lacks a collective title, transcribe the titles of the individual parts as instructed in 1.1G.]

[6,7,9,11 variant: If a sound recording/motion picture or videorecording/computer file/microform lacks a collective title, either describe the item as a unit (see 6.1G2/7.1G2/9.1G2/11.1G2 and 6.1G3/7.1G3/9.1G3/11.1G3) or make a separate description for each separately titled part (see 6.1G4/7.1G4/9.1G4/11.1G4).]

[8 variant: If a graphic item lacks a collective title, transcribe the titles of the individual parts as instructed in 1.1G.]

[10 variant: If an item lacks a collective title, transcribe the titles of the individual parts as instructed in 1.1G.]

1.1G2. If, in an item lacking a collective title, no one work predominates, either describe the item as a unit (see 1.1G3) or make a separate description for each separately titled work, linking the separate descriptions with notes (see 1.7B21). [12 missing]

[3 variant: 3.1G4. Optionally, make a separate description for each separately titled part of an item lacking a collective title. For the statement of extent in each of these descriptions, see 3.5B4. Link the separate descriptions with notes (see 3.7B21).]

[6 variant: 6.1G4. Optionally, make a separate description for each separately titled work on a sound recording. For the statement of the extent in each of these descriptions, see 6.5B3. Link the separate descriptions with notes (see 6.7B21). For instructions on sources of information, see 6.0B.]

[7 variant: 7.1G4. Optionally, make a separate description for each separately titled work on a motion picture or videorecording. For the statement of the extent in each of these descriptions, see 7.5B3. Link the separate descriptions with notes (see 7.7B21).]

[9 variant: 9.1G4. Optionally, make a separate description for each separately titled part of an item lacking a collective title. For the statement of extent in each of these descriptions, see 9.5B2. Link the separate descriptions with notes (see 9.7B21). For instructions on sources of information, see 9.0B.]

[11 variant: 11.1G4. Optionally, make a separate description for each separately titled work on a microform. For the description of the extent in each of these descriptions, see 11.5B3. Link the separate descriptions with notes (see 11.7B21).]
1.1G3. If describing the item as a unit, transcribe the titles of the individually titled works in the order in which they appear in the chief source of information or, if there is no single chief source of information, in the order in which they appear in the item, treating multiple sources of information as if they were one source (see 1.0H). [12 missing]

Separate the titles of the works by semicolons if the works are all by the same person(s) or emanate from the same body (bodies), even if the titles are linked by a connecting word or phrase. Follow the title of each work by its parallel title(s) and other title information. [12 missing]

If the individual works are by different persons or emanate from different bodies, or in case of doubt, follow the title of each work by its parallel title(s), other title information, and statement(s) of responsibility. Separate the groups of data with a full stop followed by two spaces. [12 missing]

1.1G4. If, in an item lacking a collective title, more than one (but not all) of the separately titled works predominate, treat the predominating works as instructed in 1.1G3, and name the other work(s) in contents notes (see 1.7B18). [12 missing]

[2,5,8 variant: 2.1G2/5.1G2/8.1G2. Make the relationship between statements of responsibility and the parts of an item lacking a collective title clear by additions as instructed in 2.1F2/5.1F2/8.1F2.]

[3,6,7 variant: 3.1G3/6.1G3/7.1G3. Make the relationship between statements of responsibility and the parts of an item lacking a collective title and described as a unit clear by additions as instructed in 3.1F2/6.1F3/7.1F2.]

[3 variant: 3.1G5. If a cartographic item lacking a collective title consists of a large number of physically separate parts, supply a collective title as instructed in 3.1B4.]
Appendix C: Some Definitions From Various Sources

What follows are definitions compiled from the following sources:


**Class of materials.**

The broad class or specific class of materials to which an item belongs. (Delsey definition)

The Task Force notes that the term ‘class of materials’ is used in rule 0.24 to refer to whatever is the subject of a chapter in Part I of AACR2R. That means that ‘class of materials’ encompasses content (e.g. maps), carrier (e.g. microforms), form of issuance (e.g. serials) and published vs. unpublished (e.g. manuscripts). The lack of clear logic in the creation of the category ‘class of materials’ is the real source of the problems with rule 0.24.

**Collection.**

A collection of documents, normally formed by or around a person, family, corporate body, or subject, assembled by a library or by a previous owner. (Delsey definition)

**Container.**

Any housing for a [document], a group of [documents], or part of a [document] that is physically separable form the material being housed. (AACR2R glossary as modified in brackets by Delsey)

**Content.**

The intellectual or artistic substance contained in a document or document part. (Delsey definition)
Content part.

An individual component of the intellectual or artistic content of a document or document part. (Delsey definition)

Copy.

A single specimen of a document. (Delsey definition)

Document.

An object that comprises intellectual and/or artistic content and is conceived, produced, and/or issued as an entity. (Delsey definition)

Document part.

A physically separate component of a document. (Delsey definition)

Edition/Expression.

AACR2R definition of edition:

Edition: Books, pamphlets, fascicles, single sheets, etc. All copies produced from essentially the same type image (whether by direct contact or by photographic or other methods) and issued by the same entity. See also Facsimile reproduction, Impression, Issue, Reprint.

Edition: Computer files. All copies embodying essentially the same content and issued by the same entity.

Edition: Unpublished items. All copies made from essentially the same original production (e.g. the original and carbon copies of a typescript).

Edition: Other materials. All copies produced from essentially the same master copy and issued by the same entity. A change in the identity of the distributor does not mean a change of edition. See also Facsimile reproduction, Issue.

FRBR definition of expression:

The intellectual or artistic realization of a work in the form of alphanumeric, musical, or choreographic notation, sound, image, object, movement, etc., or any combination of such forms.

An expression is the specific intellectual or artistic form that a work takes each time it is “realized.” Expression encompasses, for example, the specific words, sentences, paragraphs, etc. that result from the realization of a work
in the form of a text, or the particular notes, phrasing, etc. resulting from the realization of a musical work. The boundaries of the entity expression are defined, however, so as to exclude aspects of physical form, such as typeface and page layout, that are not integral to the intellectual or artistic realization of the work as such.

Inasmuch as the form of expression is an inherent characteristic of the expression, any change in form (e.g., from alpha-numeric notation to spoken word) results in a new expression. Similarly, changes in the intellectual conventions or instruments that are employed to express a work (e.g., translation from one language to another) result in the production of a new expression. Strictly speaking, any change in intellectual or artistic content constitutes a change in expression. Thus, if a text is revised or modified, the resulting expression is considered to be a new expression, no matter how minor the modification may be.

Examples

- **w1** Ellwanger’s *Tennis – bis zum Turnierspieler*
  - **e1** the original German text
  - **e2** the English translation by Wendy Gill
  - . . .

- **w1** Franz Schubert’s *Trout quintet*
  - **e1** the composer’s score
  - **e2** a performance by the Amadeus Quartet and Hephzibah Menuhin on piano
  - **e3** a performance by the Cleveland Quartet and Yo-Yo Ma on the cello

**Infexion.**

The formatting of intellectual or artistic content. (Delsey definition) Examples from the Delsey document include:

- Sound recording
  - Type of recording (analog, digital, optical, magnetic)
  - Playing speed
  - Groove characteristic (grooves per inch, lateral vs. vertical)
  - Track characteristic (no. of tracks, placement of tracks)
  - Kind of sound (mono., stereo.)
  - Recording/reproduction characteristic (Dolby)
Film
- Aspect ratio (anamorphic)
- Projection speed (fps)
- Sound characteristic (sd. Vs. silent, opt vs. mag, separate or on film)
- Form of print (generation)

Videorecording
- Videorecording characteristic (Beta vs. VHS, high band vs. low band)
- Sound characteristic (sd. Vs. si.)

Computer file
- Recording density
- Sectoring
- Sound characteristic

Graphic content
- Colour

Microform
- Polarity
- Reduction ratio

Alternative format materials
- Format

**Integrating entity.**

**Multiple Characteristics Option 1 Subgroup proposed definition of integrating entity:**

An integrating entity is a bibliographic item issued with the potential for seamless integration of new data into the content (e.g., looseleaf services, online databases and some Web sites). Note that monographs and serials accompanied by materials issued in differing forms from the material they accompany are not to be considered integrating entities and treated either as monographs or serials. Equally, monographs and other bibliographic items issued in discrete physical parts (e.g., serials, electronic resources such as CD-ROMs, electronic disks, etc.) are not to be considered integrating entities.
Item.

A document or set of documents in any physical form, published, issued, or treated as an entity, and as such forming the basis for a single bibliographic description. (AACR2R glossary)

A single exemplar of a manifestation. Item is a concrete entity. It may comprise more than one physical object. (FRBR)

The item may equate to any one of a number of candidate entities: Document, Document part, Copy, Content part, or Collection. (Delsey definition of Item) According to Delsey, item is abstract.

Manifestation.

The physical embodiment of an expression of a work. A manifestation represents all the physical objects that bear the same characteristics, in respect to both intellectual content and physical form. When the production process involves changes in physical form, the resulting product is considered a new manifestation. Changes in physical form include changes affecting display characteristics (e.g., a change in typeface, size of font, page layout, etc.), changes in physical medium (e.g., a change from paper to microfilm as the medium of conveyance), and changes in the container (e.g., a change from cassette to cartridge as the container for a tape). Where the production process involves a publisher, producer, distributor, etc., and there are changes signaled in the product that are related to publication, marketing, etc. (e.g., a change in publisher, repackaging, etc.), the resulting product may be considered a new manifestation (FRBR 3.2.3).

Note that this definition of manifestation, if adopted in AACR2R, would require the removal from EDITION 2 of the requirement for issuance from the same entity.

Monograph.

AACR2R definition of monograph:

A nonserial item (i.e., an item either complete in one part or complete, or intended to be completed, in a finite number of separate parts).

Multiple Characteristics Option 1 Subgroup proposed definition of monograph.

A monograph is a bibliographic item complete in one part or complete or intended to be completed in a finite number of separate parts within a fixed period of time (e.g., printed books, manuscripts, music scores, motion
pictures and videorecordings, 3-D artifacts and realia, electronic resources such as CD-ROMs, electronic disks, some Web sites, etc.).

**Physical carrier.**

The physical form of the carrier for the content of a document or document part (Delsey definition)

**Serial.**

**AACR2R definition of serial:**

A publication in any medium issued in successive parts bearing numeric or chronological designations and intended to be continued indefinitely. Serials include periodicals; newspapers; annuals (reports, yearbooks, etc.); the journals, memoirs, proceedings, transactions, etc., of societies; and numbered monographic series. See also Series 1.

**Multiple Characteristics Option 1 Subgroup proposed definition of serial.**

A serial is a bibliographic item issued in successive parts usually bearing numeric or chronological designations and ongoing, so intended to be continued indefinitely with no predetermined conclusion, and in any medium, including print, microform and direct and remote electronic resources. Serials include journals, magazines, annuals, some conference proceedings, newspapers, monographic series.

**Work.**

A distinct intellectual or artistic creation. Paraphrases, rewritings, adaptations for children, parodies, musical variations on a theme and free transcriptions of a musical composition, adaptations of a work from one literary or art form to another (e.g., dramatizations, adaptations from one medium of the graphic arts to another, etc.), abstracts, digests and summaries represent new works. (FRBR 3.2.1) Work is an abstract entity. (FRBR, p. 16)
Appendix D: A Quick Study of Where the Rules in Any Given ISBD Area Differ Based on Class of Material in Current AACR2R

The Task Force did a quick study of how often rules in any given ISBD area differ based on content, carrier or form of issuance, and found that the potential for the need to set up tables of precedence in a reorganization might be rather high (although this was a very quick and dirty study). See below:

**Content chapters:**

- Chapter 3, Cartographic materials
- Chapter 5, Music
- Chapter 6, Sound recordings (for new works, e.g. ethnographic recordings, bird songs)
- Chapter 7, Motion pictures and videorecordings (for new works and adaptations of existing works)
- Chapter 8, Graphic materials
- Chapter 9, Computer files (for programs and new works)
- Chapter 10, Three-dimensional artefacts and realia

**Carrier chapters:**

- Chapter 2, Books pamphlets and printed sheets
- Chapter 6, Sound recordings (for musical performances and talking books)
- Chapter 7, Motion pictures and videorecordings (for musical performances only)
- Chapter 9, Computer files (for digitized copies and versions of non-computer files)
- Chapter 11, Microforms

**Form of issuance chapters:**

- Chapter 12, Serials

**Other:**

- Chapter 4, Manuscripts (including manuscript collections) (published vs. unpublished; method of management)
- Chapter 13, Analysis (part-whole relationships)
Where the rules differ from chapter to chapter:

CHIEF SOURCE

Content (3,5,6,7,8,10)
Carrier (2,7,8,9,11)
Form of issuance (12)
Other (Early printed monographs (2.13),4,13)

AREA 1

Content (3,5,6,7,8,9,10)
Carrier (7,9)
Form of issuance (12)
Other (Early printed monographs (2.14),4)

AREA 2

Content (9)
Form of issuance (12)
Other (Early printed monographs (2.15))

AREA 3

Content (3,6,9)*
Carrier (9)
Form of issuance (12)
*Note that archival moving image materials (Chapter 7) also use Area 3 for country of production.

AREA 4

Content (5,6,8,10)
Carrier (6)
Form of issuance (12)
Other (Early printed monographs (2.16), 4, early printed music (5.4B2))

AREA 5

Content (3,5,6,7,8,9,10)
Carrier (2,6,7,9,11)
Form of issuance (12)
Other (Early printed monographs (2.17),4,13)
AREA 6

Form of issuance (12)
Other (4)

AREA 7

Content (3,5,7,8,9,10)
Carrier (6,7,9,11)
Form of issuance (12)
Other (Early printed monographs (2.18),4,13)

AREA 8

Other (4)
Appendix E: AACR2R Chapters Compared to ISBD

This chart was compiled by Martha Yee because of a concern about the impact in change to rule 0.24 (especially reorganization of AACR2 by ISBD area) on the correspondence between AACR2R and the ISBDs mandated by rule 0.22. The chart demonstrates that there is not a perfect relationship now between AACR2R chapters and the ISBDs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AACR2R chapter</th>
<th>ISBD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Books, pamphlets and printed sheets</td>
<td>ISBD(M), ISBD(A)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Cartographic materials</td>
<td>ISBD(CM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Manuscripts</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Music</td>
<td>ISBD(PM), ISBD(A)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Sound recordings</td>
<td>ISBD(NBM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Motion pictures and videorecordings</td>
<td>ISBD(NBM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Graphic materials</td>
<td>ISBD(NBM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Computer files</td>
<td>ISBD(ER)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Three-dimensional artefacts and realia</td>
<td>ISBD(NBM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Microforms</td>
<td>ISBD(NBM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Serials</td>
<td>ISBD(S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Analysis</td>
<td>all</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix F: AACR2R Chapters Compared to GMD’s and SMD’s

This chart was compiled by Martha Yee to advance discussion of the impact of change in rule 0.24 on the current GMD’s and SMD’s in AACR2R. It was also compiled because of what it revealed about various relationships between content and carrier. For example, one use of this chart is to indicate roughly what can be copied onto what; text can be copied onto microfilm, but not onto a videorecording, for example; a motion picture can be copied onto a videorecording, but not onto text. Note that a computer file can be copied onto text (on-demand printing of Web documents).

Another reason for its compilation was to indicate how much cross-classification exists in the AACR2R chapters. For example, you can have a digitized manuscript map. Would the GMD be [computer file], [manuscript] or [map]?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AACR2R chapter</th>
<th>GMD (United States)</th>
<th>SMD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. Cartographic materials</td>
<td>*activity card *braille *chart computer file *flash card? *game *globe kit *manuscript *map microform *picture (for aerial photographs?) slide transparency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*not used by LC
| 4. Manuscripts | computer file  
*manuscript  
*map?  
Microform?  
*music?  
Slide?  
Transparency?  |
|----------------|---------------------------------------------------|
| 5. Music       | *activity card  
*braille  
computer file  
*flash card?  
*kit  
*manuscript microform  
*music slide?  
Transparency?  |
|                | Score  
condensed score  
close score  
miniature score  
piano [violin,etc.]  
   conductor part  
vocal score  
piano score  
chorus score  
part  |
| 6. Sound recordings | computer file  
kit  
sound recording  |
|                | sound cartridge  
sound cassette  
sound disc  
sound tape reel  
sound track film  |
| 7. Motion pictures and videorecordings | computer file  
kit  
motion picture videorecording  |
|                | film cartridge  
film cassette  
film loop  
film reel  
videocartridge  
videocassette  
videodisc  
videoreel  |
| 8. Graphic materials | *activity card  
*art original  
*art reproduction  
*chart  
computer file filmstrip  
*flash card kit  
*technical drawings  |
|                | Activity card  
art original  
art print  
art reproduction chart  
filmslip  
filmstrip  
flash card  
flip chart  
photograph  
picture  
postcard  
poster  |
| 8. Graphic materials (cont.) | radiograph slide  
stereograph study print  
technical drawing transparency  
wall chart |
|-----------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| 9. Computer files | computer file  
*game  
kit  
*text |
| Computer cartridge  
computer cassette computer disk computer reel |
| 10. Three-dimensional artefacts and realia | *diorama  
*game  
kit  
*microscope slide  
*model  
*realia  
*toy |
| art original  
art reproduction  
braille cassette  
diorama exhibit  
game  
microscope slide  
mock-up  
model |
| 11. Microforms | *activity card  
*art reproduction  
*chart  
*flash card  
*game  
kit  
*manuscript  
*map  
microform  
*music  
*picture  
*technical drawing |
| Aperture card  
microfiche  
microfilm  
microopaque |
| 12. Serials | *activity card  
*braille  
*chart  
computer file  
diorama  
filmstrip  
*flash card  
*game  
*globe  
kit  
*map |
| 12. Serials (cont.) | microform  
|                    | *microscope slide  
|                    | *model  
|                    | motion picture  
|                    | *music  
|                    | *picture  
|                    | *realia  
|                    | slide  
|                    | sound recording  
|                    | *technical drawing  
|                    | *toy  
|                    | transparency  
|                    | videorecording  
| 13. Analysis | *activity card  
|                | *braille  
|                | *chart  
|                | computer file  
|                | *diorama  
|                | filmstrip  
|                | *flash card  
|                | *game  
|                | *globe  
|                | kit  
|                | *manuscript?  
|                | *map  
|                | microform  
|                | *microscope slide  
|                | *model  
|                | motion picture  
|                | *music  
|                | *picture  
|                | *realia  
|                | slide  
|                | sound recording  
|                | *technical drawing  
|                | *toy  
|                | transparency  
|                | videorecording  

83
Appendix G: AACR2R (United States) Compared to MARC 21

The following table was compiled by Martha Yee to advance discussion of the impact of change in rule 0.24 on MARC 21. It was an attempt to diagram the current relationship among AACR2R chapters, GMD’s and SMD’s, and MARC 21 leader, 008/006 and 007 codes. (If retained, it should probably be reviewed by a MARC 21 expert for accuracy.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AACR2R chapter</th>
<th>GMD (United States)</th>
<th>SMD</th>
<th>MARC 21 leader</th>
<th>MARC 21 008/006</th>
<th>MARC 21 007</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Books, pamphlets and printed sheets</td>
<td>*activity card</td>
<td>*not used by LC</td>
<td>06/a</td>
<td>008/18-34 (books)</td>
<td>007/00=c (computer file), h (microform), t (text)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*braille</td>
<td>*chart (broadside?)</td>
<td>07/m, c? (collection), d? (subunit)</td>
<td>006 (books)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>computer file</td>
<td>Kit</td>
<td>08/a (archival control)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*flash card?</td>
<td>Microform</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kit</td>
<td>*slide?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*text transparency?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Cartographic materials</td>
<td>*activity card</td>
<td></td>
<td>06/e, f (manuscript)</td>
<td>008/18-34 (maps)</td>
<td>007/00=a (map), c (computer file), d (globe), g (projected graphic), h (microform), k (nonprojected graphic), r (remote-sensing image)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*braille</td>
<td>atlas</td>
<td>07/a, b, c, d, m, s</td>
<td>006 (maps)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*chart</td>
<td>diagram</td>
<td>08/a (archival control)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>computer file</td>
<td>globe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*flash card?</td>
<td>map</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*game</td>
<td>map section</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*globe</td>
<td>profile</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kit</td>
<td>relief model</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*manuscript</td>
<td>remote-sensing image</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*map</td>
<td>view</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>microform</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*picture (for aerial photographs?)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>slide</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>transparency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Manuscripts</td>
<td>computer file</td>
<td></td>
<td>06/d (music), f (cartographic), t</td>
<td>007/00=c (computer file), h (microform), t (text)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*manuscript</td>
<td>score</td>
<td>07/c, d</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*map?</td>
<td>condensed score</td>
<td>08/a (archival control)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Microform?</td>
<td>close score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*music?</td>
<td>miniature score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Slide?</td>
<td>score piano [violin, etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transparency?</td>
<td>conductor part</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>vocal score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>piano score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>chorus score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>part</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Music</td>
<td>*activity card</td>
<td></td>
<td>06/c, d (manuscript)</td>
<td>008/18-34 (music)</td>
<td>007/00=c (computer file), h (microform), t (text)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*braille</td>
<td>score</td>
<td>07/a, b, c, d, m, s</td>
<td>006 (music)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>computer file</td>
<td>condensed score</td>
<td>08/a (archival control)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*flash card?</td>
<td>close score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*kit</td>
<td>miniature score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*manuscript</td>
<td>score piano [violin, etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>microform</td>
<td>conductor part</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*music</td>
<td>vocal score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>slide?</td>
<td>piano score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transparency?</td>
<td>chorus score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>part</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Examples</td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6. Sound recordings</strong></td>
<td>computer file kit sound recording</td>
<td>sound cartridge sound cassette sound disc sound tape reel sound track film 06/i (nonmusical), j (musical) 07/a, b, c, d, m, s 08/a (archival control) 007/00= c (computer file), s (sound recording)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>7. Motion pictures and videorecordings</strong></td>
<td>computer file kit motion picture videorecording</td>
<td>film cartridge film cassette film loop film reel video cartridge video cassette video disc videoreel 06/g (projected medium) 07/a, b, c, d, m, s 08/a (archival control) 008/18-34 (visual materials) 006 (visual materials) 007/00= c (computer file), m (motion picture), s (sound recording for sound track film), v (videorecording)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8. Graphic materials</strong></td>
<td>*activity card *art original *art reproduction *chart computer file filmstrip *flash card kit microform *picture slide *technical drawings</td>
<td>activity card art original art print art reproduction chart filmslip filmstrip flash card flip chart photograph picture postcard poster radiograph slide stereograph study print technical drawing transparency wall chart 06/k (two-dimensional, nonprojectable) 07/a, b, c, d, m, s 08/a (archival control) 008/18-34 (visual materials) 006 (visual materials) 007/00= c (computer file), g (projected graphic), h (microform), k (nonprojected graphic)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>9. Computer files</strong></td>
<td>computer file kit *text</td>
<td>computer cartridge computer cassette computer disk computer reel 06/m 07/a, b, c, d, m, s 08/a (archival control) 008/18-34 (computer files) 006 (computer files) 007/00= a (map), c (computer file), g (projected graphic), k (nonprojected graphic), m (motion picture), r (remote-sensing image), s (sound recording), t (text), v (videorecording)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>diorama</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>game kit</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>microscope slide</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>model</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>realia</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>toy</em></td>
<td><em>activity card</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>art reproduction</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>chart</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>flash card</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>game kit</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>manuscript</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>map microform</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>music picture</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>technical drawing</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>transparency videorecording</em></td>
<td><em>activity card</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>braille</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>chart computer file</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>diorama filmstrip</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>flash card</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>game globe</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>kit map</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>microform microscope slide model</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>motion picture music picture</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>picture realia slide</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>sound recording technical drawing</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>toy transparency videorecording</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>art original art reproduction braille cassette diorama exhibit game microscope slide mock-up model</td>
<td>aperture card microfiche microfilm microopaque</td>
<td>07/b (serial component part),s 008/13-34 (serials) 006 (serials)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06/r 07/a, b, c, d, m, s 08/a (archival control)</td>
<td>07/a, b, c, d, m, s 08/a (archival control)</td>
<td>007/00=a (map), c (computer file), d (globe), g (projected graphic), h (microform), k (nonprojected graphic), m (motion picture), r (remote-sensing image), s (sound recording), t (text?), v (video-recording)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>008/18-34 (visual materials) 006 (visual materials)</td>
<td>008/18-34 (books, music, serials, mixed) 006 (books, music, serials, mixed)</td>
<td>007/00=a (map), c (computer file), d (globe), g (projected graphic), h (microform), k (nonprojected graphic), m (motion picture), r (remote-sensing image), s (sound recording), t (text?), v (video-recording)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Analysis</td>
<td>*activity card</td>
<td>07/a (monographic component part), b (serial component part)</td>
<td>all?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*braille</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*chart</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>computer file</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*diorama</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>filmstrip</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*flash card</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*game</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*globe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>kit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*manuscript?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*map</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>microform</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*microscope slide</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*model</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>motion picture</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*music</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*picture</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*realia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>slide</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>sound recording</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*technical drawing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*toy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>transparency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>videorecording</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix H: Options Considered by the Task Force on Rule 0.24 But Not Worked On

Option 5 to deal with multiple characteristics. Reorganize the current chapters 1-13 such that they cover fundamental content only, with chapters on cataloguing:

- textual/alpha-numeric content (currently Chapter 2, Books, Pamphlets and Printed Sheets, and Chapter 4, Manuscripts (Including Manuscript Collections); or should the latter be considered to be dealing predominantly with the unpublished aspect and/or the archival management aspect?)
- textual/alpha-numeric sound (currently Chapter 6, Sound Recordings; consider incorporating with textual/alpha-numeric content?)
- musical notation (currently Chapter 5, Music)
- musical sound (currently Chapter 6, Sound Recordings; consider incorporating with musical content?)
- other (not musical or textual) sound (currently Chapter 6, Sound Recordings)
- moving image content (currently Chapter 7, Motion Pictures and Videorecordings)
- graphic content (currently Chapter 8, Graphic Materials)
- spatial/cartographic/geographic content (currently Chapter 3, Cartographic Materials)
- 3-dimensional content/artefact/object (currently Chapter 10, Three-Dimensional Artefacts and Realia)
- computer programs and other predominantly digital content (currently Chapter 9, Computer Files)
- mixed (would need new chapter)

Within each chapter, include special rules to deal with conditions arising out of:

a. form of issuance (seriality vs. one-time publication vs. integrating/dynamic updating)
b. published vs. unpublished

c. ‘type of carrier’ or physical format, i.e. the physical medium onto which the fundamental content has been put in order to distribute it

d. method of management (library vs. archival/collection level records based on provenance)

e. reproduction (same physical format/different physical format; simultaneously released/successively released such that there is an “original”)

Rule 0.24 would either cease to exist, replaced by indications in the rules themselves as to which aspect other than content (carrier, form of issuance, etc.) takes precedence in case of conflict, or Rule 0.24 would have to be rewritten to provide a general table of precedence for use throughout the rules.

Option 6 to deal with multiple characteristics. Reorganize the current chapters 1-13 such that they are based on publication/stabilization type, with chapters on monographs, serials and integrating entities. Within each chapter, include special rules to deal with conditions arising out of:

a. published vs. unpublished

b. fundamental content (textual/alpha-numeric content, textual/alpha-numeric sound, musical notation, musical sound, other sound, moving image content, graphic content, spatial/cartographic/geographic content, 3-dimensional content/artefact/object, computer program, mixed)

c. ‘type of carrier’ or physical format, i.e. the physical medium onto which the fundamental content has been put in order to distribute it

d. method of management (library vs. archival/collection level records based on provenance)

e. reproduction (same physical format/different physical format; simultaneously released/successively released such that there is an “original”)

Rule 0.24 would either cease to exist, replaced by indications in the rules themselves as to which aspect other than publication/stabilization type (content, carrier, etc.) takes precedence in case of conflict, or Rule 0.24 would have to be rewritten to provide a general table of precedence for use throughout the rules.
Option 6 to deal with format variations. Reverse the order of chapters in AACR2R, putting the current 1-13 after the current 21-26, so that the cataloguer classifies an item in the following order:

a. as to authorship (main entry, Chapter 21)

b. as to work (main entry, Chapters 21 and 25)

c. as to edition (represented by a bibliographic record; change 0.24 to a rule for when to make a new bibliographic record?)

d. as to physical format and distributor (represented by holdings records? Include in AACR2R rules for creating holdings records attached to bibliographic records?)
Appendix I: Discussion of the Definitions of Edition/Expression, Manifestation, Item, and Related Work

By Martha Yee, submitted to Task Force for discussion

Edition/expression.

EDITION 1  The classical definition, of course, is that of a resetting of the type. That might be called the strict bibliographer’s use of the term. Such an edition may not in fact have any significant textual differences, if the typesetter was very good and simply replicated a previous edition word for word. However, the recognition that, in the days of the printing press, resetting of type offered a prime opportunity for making changes in the text, led to edition in this sense being assumed to be of interest to not just bibliographers, but also library users mainly interested in texts rather than in the physical history of the book. AACR2R broadened this edition a bit to cover type images (rather than reset type) and master copies (for materials that use other means of expression besides text).

To distinguish between the case a) in which two documents have the exact same content stream (text, sound and/or image), but different infixion (e.g. different setting of type, different playback speed) and the case b) in which two documents have had revisions in the content stream introduced in the course of changing the infixion (e.g. text variants between settings of the type), I would propose that we call the former CONTENT IDENTICAL EDITION (EDITION 1.1) and the latter VARIANT CONTENT EDITION (EDITION 1.2). Note that in standard cataloguing, cataloguers have no way of knowing which of these they are dealing with once the infixion has changed, as signalled by such clues as a change in paging or a difference in playing time, unless the item carries an explicit statement concerning differences in content, e.g. ‘revised edition.’

EDITION 2  The looser cataloguer’s use of the term is reflected in the AACR1 quote, ‘to distinguish it from ... other editions of the same work, and, in some instances, from other issues of the same edition.’ The fact that different issues of the same edition can have quite different title pages, including variant titles which can be cited by users and sought in catalogues, and the fact that the same type image (setting of type) can be reissued with additional material, has led cataloguers to use a looser definition than bibliographers that might be characterized as ‘same work, but with differences in content or representation significant to users (even if the text contained is the same according to the EDITION 1 definition).’ AACR2R’s glossary definitions make reference to changes in issuing entity causing creation of a new edition, for example.
According to both definitions, a change in text, such as revision, abridgement or translation, would create a new edition.

To distinguish between the case a) in which two documents represent the same EDITION 1 but have different titles or series titles on the title page (different title page representation), and the case b) in which two documents represent the same EDITION 1 but have appended material such as commentaries and the like, I would propose that the former be called TITLE EDITION (EDITION 2.1) and the latter be called EDITION BY APPENDAGE (EDITION 2.2). Note that changes in representation other than changes in title are covered below under Manifestation.

The situation is complicated by the fact that one particular edition may actually be more than one of the above types. For example, a CONTENT IDENTICAL EDITION (1.1) may also be an EDITION BY APPENDAGE (2.2), as when the type image of an earlier edition is reissued with a new commentary. Therefore, I would suggest that the following priority list of types of edition should be followed, and the highest category into which a particular edition falls should be held to determine what type of edition it is:

- Variant content edition (1.2)
- Edition by appendage (2.2)
- Title edition (2.1)
- Identical content edition (1.1)

According to this practice, the example above of a content identical edition with an appendage would be considered an edition by appendage.

If two items represent themselves as the same work, and the only differences between them consist of one or more of those listed below, current practice is to consider the two items to be two editions of the same work, i.e., separate bibliographic records, each with the same main entry.

Differences associated with a variant content edition (1.2):

- Different statement of subsidiary authorship such as inclusion of a different translator or editor
- Different edition statement (connected to change in text, e.g. different extent)
- Resetting of type (usually signalled by different paging)
- In nonbook materials, other change in actual extent, such as playing time
- Translation into another language
- Revision of a text by the same author(s) as the original
- Reproduction of an art work
- Arrangement, transcription, etc. of the work of a composer
- Performing a musical work on a sound recording
Differences associated with an edition by appendage (2.2):

Difference in presence or absence of illustrations in physical description
Addition of illustrations to a text
Addition of commentary or biographical/critical material when the original work is emphasized in title page representation
Providing a choreography for an existing musical work, such as a ballet
Adding an instrumental accompaniment or additional parts to a musical work

Differences associated with a title edition (2.1):

Different title not associated with a change in extent
Different series not associated with a change in extent
Different statement of responsibility, such as variation in the author’s name, not associated with a change in extent

Examples of what can vary between the editions of a work:

**Title:**

Smollett, Tobias George, 1721-1771.
*The expedition of Humphry Clinker* . . .

Smollett, Tobias George, 1721-1771.
*Humphry Clinker* . . .

**Statement of responsibility:**

The expedition of Humphry Clinker / by the author of Roderick Random.

The expedition of Humphry Clinker / by Dr. Smollett.

The expedition of Humphry Clinker / by Tobias Smollet, M.D., with 10 plates by T. Rowlandson.

L’expedition d’Humphry Clinker / traduction de Jean Giono et Catherine d’Ivernois.
Publisher and publication date:


Illustrations:


The expedition of Humphry Clinker / Tobias Smollett; introduction and notes by Thomas R. Preston; the text edited by O.M. Brack, Jr. -- Athens, Ga.: University of Georgia Press, c1990. ix, 500 p. : ill., map; 24 cm.

Paging:


(Same edition of the same work (same setting of type), despite the different publication dates.)

Series statement:


Some of us would like to argue that even a unique item is potentially a particular manifestation of a particular edition of a particular work. If it is argued that the term ‘edition’ implies publication and implies multiple copies, perhaps we need a new term that encompasses edition and a unique item with the potential to go into editions.

Also note that a particular edition can itself have editions, as when an author creates two different versions of a work (two versions of King Lear?) which themselves go into multiple editions.

There may be no significant difference between the FRBR definition for Expression (see Appendix C) and the definitions of EDITIONS 1.2 and 2.2 above. However, neither expression nor manifestation seem to deal adequately with title editions (2.1) which can affect users’ citations to a particular work.

**Manifestation.**

In order to be able to distinguish between the manifestation created by a change in physical form and the manifestation created by a change in publisher, I propose that we call them PHYSICAL FORM MANIFESTATION and PUBLISHER MANIFESTATION respectively. The latter would cover cases in which two documents represent the same EDITION 1, but have different title page representation such as different edition statements, different publisher or distributor statements, different publication, release or distribution dates, etc.

**Item.**

Note that in AACR1 this term seems to have been used as a synonym for ‘edition/issue’ when applied to nonbook materials. The Paris principles just refer to ‘editions of a work’ to mean the items that contain the work in the various ways in which it has been made concrete. In AACR2R, however, item encompasses manifestation, expression, all definitions of edition above, and related work; it just means the object of a separate record (see Appendix C). It is a term that is much less meaningful than the term ‘edition;’ it is not used by library users, and it is really just functioning as a cipher term to stand in for ‘object of a cataloguing record.’ It does not convey to users the meaning ‘same work, but with different intellectual or artistic content,’ as the term ‘edition’ does.

**Related work.**

A new work that has been generated from a previously existing work by means of adaptation, paraphrasing, rewriting, etc. (Martha Yee’s proposed definition, derived from the FRBR definition of work)
Currently, AACR2R rules call for considering the following changes to be substantial enough to cause the creation of a new work (signalled by a change in main entry):

- rewriting of a text in another form, e.g. the dramatization of a novel
- filming of a play
- adaptation of an art work from one medium to another (e.g. an engraving of a painting)
- changing of the title of a work entered under title (including both monographs and serials)
- revision of a text accompanied by a change in representation of authorship or change in title
- addition of commentary or biographical/critical material when the commentary or biographical/critical material is emphasized in title page representation
- free transcription of the work of a composer
- merely basing a musical work on other music, e.g. variations on a theme setting a pre-existing text to music